

City Council

Monday 18 September 2023

PRESENT:

Councillor Shayer, in the Chair.

Councillor Ms Watkin, Vice Chair.

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Laing, Lowry, Luggier, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy and Wakeham.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Bingley, Dr Cree, Finn, Loveridge and Tofan.

The meeting started at 2.04 pm and finished at 8.36 pm.

Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at www.plymouth.gov.uk. At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

24. Minutes

Before this item the Lord Mayor welcomed Councillors Alison Raynsford and Stefan Krizanac to the Chamber.

The minutes of the meetings held on 19 June 2023 were agreed as a correct record.

25. Declarations of Interest

The Lord Mayor announced that a General Dispensation had been granted by the Monitoring Officer to all Members, in relation to item 12 - Independent Remuneration Panel.

The following declarations of interest were made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in respect of items under consideration at the meeting -

Name	Item Number	Reason	Interest
Councillor Holloway	13D	Was employed by a company that provided software for online meetings.	Personal
Councillor Stoneman	11	Family employed by the Local Authority	Pecuniary
Councillor Reilly	11	Family employed by the Local Authority	Pecuniary

26. **Appointments to committees, outside bodies and Council Proportionality**

The Council agreed to note the appointments to Committees, Outside Bodies and Council Proportionality, as detailed within the report.

27. **Questions by the Public**

There were 5 questions from members of the public received in accordance with the Constitution:

The following question was submitted by George Wheeler -	
Question: The 2023-4 budget included provision for a further £20,000 to be made towards replacement of the public toilets in St Budeaux Square. Can you tell me when this work is to be undertaken, please?	Answer: You are right in identifying that a £20,000 provision was included in the Council budget for 2023/24. This is directly because of the Plymouth Labour amendment moved as a result of the lobbying by Councillor Haydon. This administration is committed to the provision of public toilets in the vicinity of St Budeaux Square and shops. Over the past few months, I have had conversations with Councillors Haydon and Dingle about the provision of these toilets. I am happy to support their campaign and want to hear from the people of St Budeaux. I have already announced that the Council will open a consultation of future provisions of St Budeaux toilets by the end of September. The consultation will run for two months. I will review the findings of the consultation in order to ensure that the new toilets we provide meet local needs and aspirations. I will then commission provision of toilets for St Budeaux.
The following question as submitted by Dave Curno -	
Question: PCC confirmed it would seek peer advice from another Council when considering the Armada Way TPO application and that it had approached another Council. PCC's reply to a FOI request FS-case-541381192 indicates this was not in fact done. Who made the decision not to request recommendations from another Council?	Answer: Thank you for your latest question on Armada Way. The previous FOI was answered factually when we responded: 'that Plymouth City Council did not request or receive any recommendation from another Local Authority in respect of the TPO request for Armada Way'. In response to a complaint to the Council's Monitoring Officer about a potential conflict of

	<p>interest between officers dealing with the Armada Way project and those assessing the TPO request, it was agreed by the Strategic Director for Place and the Monitoring Officer that the TPO should be subject to independent assessment. The Strategic Director for Place did contact a number of Local Authorities to discuss the process for conducting an independent TPO assessment. At no time did the Strategic Director request or receive their review or recommendation on the merits of the Armada Way TPO case. The Strategic Director for Place delegated the decision making powers in respect of assessing the request for a TPO to the Head of Development Management. The Head of Development Management appointed an independent Tree Consultant - JK Tree Consultancy - to carry out the TPO assessment and make a recommendation for the consideration of the Head of Development Management. It is common practice for Council's to seek advice from independent and appropriately qualified chartered consultants. Therefore, no one made a decision not to request recommendations from other authorities.</p>
--	--

The following question was asked by Mr Ramage -

Question: Christian Aid has moved away from using Barclays as its bank because of their record on fossil fuel financing and their lack of commitment to improve in this area. I have previously asked PCC to review its use of Barclays and received a dismissive reply. Cause for a re-think?

Answer: We believe that the Christian Aid based their decision on the outcome of a competitive tendering process following a review of their banking arrangements. There are limited suppliers in the market providing banking services to local authorities (currently two) and the Council has to consider the risk of reputational damage due to all of the administrative changes required when moving to a different banking provider. The Council adopts the key recommendations of CIPFA's (Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy) Treasury Management (TM) in the Public Services: Code of Practice, with annual updates, the last

	<p>update being in March 2023. When investing in banks and funds, the Council will 'prioritise banks that are signatories to the UN Principles for Responsible Banking and funds operated by managers that are signatories to the UN Principles for Responsible Investment, the Net Zero Asset Managers Alliance and/or the UK Stewardship Code.' Barclays are signatories to the UN Principles for Responsible Banking and the Net Zero Asset Managers Alliance. Please note, the Council does not undertake any active investment with Barclays Bank other than through their daily banking activity, as they are the Council's main provider of banking services.</p>
<p>The following question was asked by Gin Farrow-Jones -</p>	
<p>Question: By vote abstaining on the 'meaningful community engagement', Labour effectively approved of the decision for it to be the response to the petition on the trees. Are you satisfied with how the overwhelming opposition to the Armada Way scheme was dealt within the document?</p>	<p>Thank you for your question. Plymouth Labour proposed and passed an amendment during that City Council meeting held on 30 January 2023 to reflect our concerns about the Armada Way scheme. We called for a meaningful community engagement process to take place quickly in February 2023 which prioritised the natural environment and climate resilience. The amendment also called for tree felling to be suspended. Plymouth Labour and Green councillors were dismayed at the summing up by Councillor Jonathan Drean on the substantive motion in response to the petition and, despite the nature of the debate itself, how he categorised the planned public engagement process. Labour Councillors therefore showed our frustration by supporting the Labour amendment but not voting in favour of the substantive motion - which was going to pass anyway because of the arithmetic of the City Council at that time. The way in which the consultation responses were reported on the previous Richard Bingley Armada Way scheme is the subject of on-going legal proceedings. Therefore, it would not be appropriate</p>

	for me to comment any further on these matters at this time. But what the City Council does know is that I have committed to undertake an independent review on various aspects of the Armada Way scheme in due course.
The following question was submitted by Lynn Sears -	
Question: Please will someone explain why public questions and their responses are not automatically made available during the meeting since the answers are pre prepared. Since the questions from the last meeting were not published until the minutes were done months later?	Answer: The current position is that the Lord Mayor will ask the questioner to ask their question. If the questioner is not present or an answer cannot be given on the day of the meeting, the question and response will be published as part of minutes. The Monitoring Officer will have a reply sent to the questioner within 10 working days. Councillors providing the answers sometimes change prepared responses, and as such responses may not be ready immediately. In order to ensure that questions and answers are more easily available for all residents, I have directed officers to publish the questions and answers on the council's website the day after the Council meeting.

28. **Announcements**

Councillor Tudor Evans OBE (The Leader of the Council) made the following announcements:

- a) There was a need to reflect that a year ago today, the then Prime Minister, Liz Truss, and the Chancellor of the Exchequer, announced their policies of which the repercussions were still being felt today. This had resulted in the lowest Government Bond Yields in decades, with many Plymouthians left struggling with soaring rents and mortgages. There was yet to be an apology from the Prime Minister, and the Labour Party were calling for her Resignation Honours List to not be proceeded with, as was within the current Prime Minister's powers;
- b) On Friday, the Leader and Councillor Luggar had submitted Plymouth City Council's round 2 submission to the National Lottery Heritage Fund for the National Marine Park;
- c) The Plymouth Sound National Marine Park was an exciting project, and would become the UK's 16th National Park, and the first National Marine Park anywhere in

the UK. This was a significant moment for a maritime nation, equivalent to the creation of the first national park in the Peak District in 1952;

- d) The project was a £22m project, of which Plymouth City Council were asking the Lottery for £11.6m;
- e) Consultation had been undertaken with 10,000 people to develop the project, and an amazing partnership had been developed;
- f) The project was about celebrating Plymouth's Heritage, and would focus on restoring neglected buildings across the foreshore at Mountbatten, Tinside and Mount Edgcumbe;
- g) The project would see the opening of 2 Napoleonic forts on a daily basis first for the first time;
- h) The project would work intensively with 30 schools, with a National Marine Park champion appointed in every school in the City;
- i) There would be a Nature Boost programme restoring mudflats, sea grass and estuaries to bring back wrays, seahorses, rare birds, fish, and a range of endangered species;
- j) The largest ever engagement programme would be initiated, reaching into Plymouth's northern estates. This would enable people to get in on or under the water, as well as engage through the creation a digital park;
- k) People would be encouraged to explore jobs in the new Blue/Green economy, and the Council would work with partners to become Net Zero, as demonstrated through the recent announcement at Millbay;
- l) There was a ten year funded plan to ensure that the park was sustainable, and had proper governance;
- m) Funding had been ring-fenced, and the current project stage aimed to set out the detailed plans. All of the necessary permissions had been attained, and the match funding had been secured. Subject to the Lottery approving the plan, the next phase would begin in January, helping to place Plymouth on the map.

A video was played at this point demonstrating the National Marine Park Bid.

- n) The Leader thanked David Draffan (Service Director of Economic Development) for his leadership of the programme, as well as Elaine Hayes (CEO National Marine Park) Sharon Mercer (Head of Strategic Programmes), Kat Deeney (Head of Environmental Planning), Councillor Patel, Councillor Briars-Delve, and Councillor Dann for all of their hard work.

Councillor Goslin joined the meeting at this time.

Councillor Sarah Allen (Chair of the Audit and Governance Committee) made the following announcement:

- o) City Council had delegated to the Audit and Governance Oversight and Scrutiny Committee, oversight and approval of the design and implementation of the Electoral Cycle Review and Consultation. Before finalising the approach, and having taken into account the advice of officers at the July meeting of the Audit and Governance Committee, it was proposed that the consultation was brought back to committee, following discussions with Southampton Council who had recently undertaken a electoral review, and a review of their electoral cycle. This had approved unanimously by the Audit and Governance Committee, and further proposals would be heard at future meetings, with a subsequent report submitted to City Council to provide an update;

Councillor Sue Dann (Cabinet Member Customer Services, Sport, Leisure and HR & OD) made the following announcements:

- p) On 23 August, the Council had launched the Cost of Living Action Plan, which Labour had pledged to implement within their first 100 days of taking administration;
- q) The plan was City-wide, and workshops had been held with 70 different organisations. It had been remarkable how the City had pulled together to offer support to those in crisis;
- r) In August alone, 2,000 people had accessed the Cost of Living Hub, and there had been over 200,000 engagements during summer;
- s) It was requested that all Councillors share information regarding the Cost of Living Action Plan within their spheres to ensure maximum coverage;
- t) The Brickfields project was ongoing, and significant work had been undertaken over past few months. In September, an agreement had been signed committing the Council to contributing £2.75 MM, Plymouth Argyle Football Club contributing £11 MM, and Plymouth Argyle Community Trust contributing £7.25 MM. A Community Use Agreement was in place for the site, which would help transform one of the most deprived wards in the city, as well as raising the profile of sports, access and the Health and Wellbeing Hub;
- u) An open day would be held at the site on 26 September 2023, and all Councillors were encouraged to attend to experience the plans for one of the City's greatest sports assets, which would have a meaningful impact on citizens across Plymouth.

Councillor Tom Briars-Delve (Cabinet Member for Environment and Climate Change) made the following announcements:

- v) Alongside longstanding funding pressures, grass cutting had faced additional challenges this year. Extreme weather conditions, exacerbated by the realities of climate change, had caused high vegetation growth. There had also been a need to address the risks to staff working near highways, with additional staff training provided, as well as the

rethinking of the approach to several high risk areas, ensuring appropriate and safe traffic management. Additional Bank Holidays had also impacted front line capacity;

- w) Despite these challenges, the team had been working hard to improve the system inherited from the previous administration. This had included additional work opportunities for staff, a dedicated cemeteries team to improve standards, trialling regular cuts in play parks following feedback from residents, and investment in specialist equipment better suited to longer vegetation;
- x) Further improvements were being explored to improve the grass-cutting season for next year, and the administration wanted Councillors across all wards and parties to be at the heart of these improvements. Officers had been asked to organise an end of season consultation on grass cutting for councillors;
- y) A challenge was presented to all councillors to identify areas within their ward that were possibly better suited as wildflower meadows, when requesting areas within their ward to be added to the regular cutting programme. This was to ensure Plymouth retains its ambition of a 60-40 principle for biodiversity;
- z) Despite challenges faced by all authorities on this topic, Plymouth had received national recognition for its 60-40 approach. Last week, Plymouth City Council had been a finalist for 3 environmental awards, and had won an award for best Parks and Grounds Maintenance Service. Tributes were paid to the Grounds team for their hard work, as well as Councillor Sue Dann for her courage in this area;
- aa) Plymouth had also recently featured in the UK 100 Power in Place Nature Report, for its innovative concepts around financing biodiversity improvements such as a habitat banking vehicle, as well as the passing of the Motion on Marine Recovery and Citizenship. It was rewarding to see Plymouth Council gaining praise and national recognition for its efforts;
- bb) There were also many projects ongoing regarding Renewable Energy. Meeting its pledge made before the election, Labour had introduced rooftop solar panels in the city centre, with the top floor of the Theatre Royal Carpark now fitted with a solar array, which generated electricity to power the carpark, as well as supporting the decarbonisation of the site;
- cc) The successful Green Minds Partnership project had come to an end, with many positive legacies visible including the establishment of Green Community Hubs, employing Council and National Trust Rangers, as well as Natural Infrastructure Officers to work closely on green spaces, alongside community partners.

Councillor Sally Cresswell (Cabinet Member for Education, Skills and Apprenticeships) made the following announcements:

- dd) The School's Attendance Campaign had started at the end of August, in partnership with schools to help support parents and carers; officer were working with children with serious attendance issues, while schools were focused on students with attendance less than 90%;

- i. ITV West Country had taken up the issue and ran an in depth item on Friday 8 September 2023 on issue of attendance, filmed at Plymstock School, and she thanked the school and students involved;
 - ii. There would be a second phase to this campaign, but urged everyone to share content on good school attendance in a positive and supportive manner;
- ee) Plymouth City Council had been proactive in communicating with school leaders regarding RAAC concrete and since 2018 surveys had been carried out on 14 local authority maintained schools, none of which were found to contain RAAC, Multi Academy Trusts were responsible for their own buildings and would have been contacted by the Department for Education on this issue, but Plymouth City Council had not been informed of any affected by the issue, but had reached out to Chief Executives and head teachers to confirm checks had taken place;
- ff) In 2010, the coalition government cut Building Schools for the Future, something Michael Gove had since admitted was a mistake, and Plymouth had been promised £70 million under this plan, but no money was ever received, and elsewhere in the country where the money was used to turn other disused buildings into schools, some had been reported as having RAAC.

Councillor Jemima Laing (Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Children’s Social Care, Culture, Events and Communications) made the following announcements:

- gg) Last week, she had updated the Growth and Infrastructure Overview and Scrutiny Committee on the impact of culture in the City over the past 12 months and the reaction from the committee was positive;
- hh) As Elected members they had proactively all made the space for culture and cultural investment when many councils had cut this area. In Plymouth, it had always been seen as an investment in the city and its people and it was important to closely monitor the impact and where appropriate to celebrate success;
- ii) Gave an update on The Box:
- i. Had welcomed over 600,000 visitors to date;#
 - ii. In 2022/23 it had had 246,000 visitors, compared to an annual visitor number of 80,000 to the old museum;
 - iii. Over the school summer holidays 52,000 visitors had been welcomed and The Box had experienced its busiest day ever;
 - iv. Over 10,000 people had been involved in the family programme with 6,500 formal learning participants;
 - v. Since opening The Box had hosted over 22,000 school visits;
 - vi. £2.25m had been raised across earned income and fundraising;
 - vii. The Box had generated £5m advertising value on press coverage over the past 12 months;
 - viii. Autumn shows included works by Sir John Akomfrah, Kedisha Coakley along with Dutch Flowers from the National Gallery;
- jj) Touching on the wider cultural sector many organisations were still recovering from the effects of the COVID19 pandemic and adjusting to new audience behaviours but it had still been an impressive year for cultural impact:
- i. A combined cultural audience across all venues, projects and events of 850,000;
 - ii. Activity across 132 cultural venues with 50% of events being free to attend;

- iii. There were 365 cultural enterprises in the City with a cultural economic output rise from £98m in 2020 to £150m in 2022/23;
 - iv. The cultural sector directory employs 3350 jobs and created 2000 new opportunities last year;
 - v. Over £12m NPO funding had been secured for Plymouth's largest organisations from the Arts Council;
 - vi. £1.5m grant project funding had been secured from 28 different sources;
- kk) Bonfire Night would return to the Hoe for 2023 as the centrepiece of a free fun campaign, which would be a major part of the Cost of Living Action Plan because one of the first things that families had to give up during a financial squeeze was little extras that made life worth living as many families were having to make the choice between eating and heating. Bonfire night engaged with communities and had an attendance of 25,000 people and had been made possible by generous sponsorship from the Plymouth Waterfront Partnership and the success of the Plymouth City Council Events team exceeding their income targets.

Councillor Chris Penberthy (Cabinet Member for Housing, Cooperative Development and Communities) made the following announcements:

- ll) Two of the stalled sites for the Plan for Homes were back on track, having been delayed by Brexit, the COVID19 pandemic and the economic turmoil of 2022;
 - i. He thanked partners in Westward Housing and Classic Builders;
 - ii. Moses Close would be a mix of 1 bedroom flats, family homes and a bungalow available for social rent;
 - iii. St Peters Close in Plympton had 5 bungalow developments, including one that would be fully accessible to meet housing needs of people on waiting lists;
- mm) Broadland Gardens was in its final construction stage and Lang Town & Country had been appointed as the and for the site, which was available for viewing with 10 eco-friendly homes, the first direct delivery of homes from Plymouth City Council in 40 years.

Councillor Zoe Reilly (VAWG Representative) made the following announcements:

- nn) In light of news relating to Russel Brand, and the concerns raised by residents, Plymouth City Council had made huge efforts to make the city a beacon for tackling violence against women and girls and had obtained a Purple flag accreditation extension, and was working towards a VAWG charter;
- oo) The Council had employed a strategic lead for Violence Against Women and Girls that worked tirelessly;
- pp) The first MAN culture conference had been held successfully on 6 September 2023;
- qq) She called on Plymouth Pavilions to reflect on whether Russell Brand's planned show there should take place in light of the news.

29. **Medium Term Financial Strategy 2023/24 - 2027/28**

The report was introduced by Councillor Mark Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance) and seconded by Councillor Ian Darcy (Chair of the Performance, Finance and Customer Service Overview and Scrutiny Committee).

Following contributions from Councillors Allen and Penberthy the Council agreed to:

I. Approve the Medium Term Financial Strategy 2023/24 – 2027/28.

For (48)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Laing, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Noble, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Abstain (4)

Councillor Mrs Beer, Nicholson, Partridge and Ricketts.

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (0)

30. **Capital Monitoring Report**

Councillor Mark Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance) introduced the report, which was seconded by Councillor Chris Penberthy (Cabinet Member for Housing, Cooperative Development and Communities).

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Briars-Delve and Sproston, Council agreed:

- I. The amended Capital Budget 2023-2028 was revised to £556.722m as shown in Table I within the report.

For (49)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Laing, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Abstain (2)

Councillors Partridge and Ricketts.

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)

Councillor Shayer.

31. **Treasury Management Annual Report 2022/23**

Councillor Mark Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance) introduced the report, which was seconded by Councillor Sarah Allen (Chair of the Audit and Governance Committee).

Following a contribution from Councillor Darcy, Council agreed:

- I. To approve the Treasury Management Annual Report 2022/23.

For (50)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Laing, Lowry, Luggier, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Abstain (1)

Councillor Ricketts.

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)

Councillor Shayer.

32. **Recommendations from Audit and Governance Committee on Stage One Constitutional changes**

The report was introduced by Councillor Sarah Allen (Chair of the Audit and Governance Committee) and seconded by Councillor Dr Mahony.

Councillor Ian Poyser proposed an amendment which was seconded by Councillor Lauren McLay.

The meeting was adjourned for 10 minutes to allow members time to consider the amendment.

Following contributions from Councillors Patrick Nicholson, Mrs Terri Beer, Bill Stevens, Council agreed to:

Contributions from Nicholson, Beer, Stevens the Council agreed to:

- I. Approve the amendments to Part A, Part B of the Constitution;
2. Refer the Petition Scheme Guidance back to the Audit and Governance Committee.

For: Councillors Apinall, Haydon Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, Murphy, Penberthy, Rennie, Stevens, Tuffin, Tuohy, Mrs Beer, Darcy, Stoneman, Goslin, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Smith, Mrs Bridgeman, Laing, Allen, Ms Watkin, Wakeham, Cresswell, Partridge, Salmon, Hulme, Harrison, Patel, Carlyle, Raynsford, Holloway, Briars-Delve, Tippetts, Reilly, Luggier, Poyser, Noble, McLay, Blight, Dingle, Gilmour, Moore, Penrose, Sproston, Stephens, McNamara and Krizanac (50)

Abstain: Councillor Ricketts (1)

Against: (0)

Absent/did not vote: Councillors Mrs Loveridge, Shayer, Dr Cree, Bingley, Tofan and Finn (6)

33. **Updated Pay Policy Statement**

(Council agreed to suspend standing orders to allow Tracey Lee (Chief Executive) to speak on the item which was proposed by the Lord Mayor and seconded by Councillor Dann).

Councillor Sue Dann introduced the report which was seconded by Councillor Tudor Evans OBE.

Following a contribution from Councillor Hulme, Council agreed to:

- I. Approve the amended Pay Policy Statement for 2023/24

For: Councillors Apinall, Haydon Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, Murphy, Penberthy, Rennie, Stevens, Tuffin, Tuohy, Mrs Beer, Darcy, Goslin, Nicholson, Smith, Mrs Bridgeman, Laing, Allen, Ms Watkin, Wakeham, Cresswell, Partridge, Salmon, Hulme, Harrison, Patel, Carlyle, Raynsford, Holloway, Briars-Delve, Tippetts, Lugger, Poyser, Noble, McLay, Blight, Dingle, Gilmour, Moore, Penrose, Sproston, Stephens, McNamara, Ricketts and Kriznanac. (48)

Abstain: (0)

Against: (0)

Absent/did not vote: Councillors Mrs Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Shayer, Dr Cree, Bingley, Tofan, Stoneman, Reilly and Finn (9)

34. **Councillor Allowance Scheme - Recommendations from the Independent Remuneration Panel**

Councillors Lowry and Reilly left the meeting at the beginning of this item.

Council agreed to suspend standing orders to enable Mr Duncan Currall (independent member of the remuneration panel which was proposed by the Lord Mayor and seconded by the Deputy Lord Mayor)

Councillors Lowry, Reilly, Stoneman returned the meeting following the vote.

The Lord Mayor proposed the report which was seconded by the Deputy Lord Mayor.

Following a contribution from Councillor Nicholson the Council agreed to approve the following amendments to the allowance scheme that:

- I. There are no changes to the Basic Councillors' Allowance and that this will continue to rise in line with staff pay awards. As pay awards currently being negotiated refer to a single consolidated addition to NJC pay points, the Panel recommends that basic

allowances should increase in line with the equivalent percentage increase to the mid-point of the pay spine (pay point 22).

2. Excluding payments to Other Minority Group Leaders (recommendation 6 below), there are no changes to the Special Responsibility Allowances (SRAs) which will increase in line with staff pay awards (as above).
3. The travel allowance for Councillors should remain the same as the locally agreed rates payable to Council staff, and that they be changed as and when the staff rates are changed.
4. The list of approved duties is applicable to both Travel and Subsistence Allowance and Dependent Carers Allowances and Councillors undertaking approved duties may claim Travel, Subsistence and Dependent carers allowance unless remuneration and/or expenses are provided by the body to which the approved duty relates
5. An annual stipend of £1500 is provided to Co-opted Members on Committees convened under the Local Government Act 1972.
6. SRAs for Other Minority Group Leaders (excluding the largest opposition group) will be payable based on the number of members in the group. For groups of less than five members, the Leader of the group will receive an annual SRA of £1000, increasing by £1000 for every five additional Councillors.
7. Facilities (group rooms etc) are offered to all Councillors. Groups with less than 5 members will share facilities with similar sized groups and non-aligned independent Councillors.
8. An expenses fund not exceeding £2000 be established in the Lord Mayor's office to cover necessary out of pocket expenses incurred by the Deputy Lord Mayor in the event that they are in receipt of a SRAs for another role and are therefore unable to claim the Deputy Lord Mayor's allowance. Any claims from the fund will be made on receipt.

For: Councillors Aspinall, Haydon Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Lowry, Hendy, Murphy, Penberthy, Rennie, Stevens, Tuffin, Tuohy, Mrs Beer, Darcy, Stoneman, Goslin, Nicholson, Smith, Mrs Bridgeman, Laing, Allen, Ms Watkin, Wakeham, Cresswell, Salmon, Hulme, Harrison, Patel, Carlyle, Raynsford, Holloway, Briars-Delve, Reilly Tippetts, Lugger, Poyser, Noble, McLay, Blight, Dingle, Gilmour, Moore, Penrose, Sproston, Stephens, McNamara, Dr Mahony and Kriznanac. (49)

Abstain: Councillors Partridge and Ricketts (2)

Against: (0)

Absent/did not vote: Councillors Mrs Loveridge, Shayer, Dr Cree, Bingley, Tofan, and Finn (6)

35. **Motions on notice**
36. **Motor neurone disease (MND)**

A video was shown to members before the break from Steven Wharton.

*(Following the video, Council took a break for 30 minutes)
Councillor Hulme did not return to the meeting.*

The motion was introduced by Councillor Jon Dingle and seconded by Councillor Sally Haydon.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Dann, Harrison, Bridgeman, Shayer Council agreed to:

1. Ask the Leader to write to the Minister for Science, Research and Innovation and the Minister for Health and Secondary Care to request increased funding for MND research and to support the raising of awareness for this condition.
2. Ask the Leader to write to the Minister for Disabled People, Health and Work to implement more targeted energy support for households affected by MND.
3. To request Plymouth City Council to review its policy regarding how people who are housebound are able to access the council's democratic processes.
4. To make Steve Wharton the Plymouth City Council Champion for those living with MND so he can work with the council to help raise awareness of this condition.

For: Councillors Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, Murphy, Penberthy, Rennie, Stevens, Tuffin, Tuohy, Mrs Beer, Darcy, Stoneman, Goslin, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Smith, Mrs Bridgeman, Laing Allen, Ms Watkin, Wakeham, Cresswell, Partridge, Salmon, Harrison, Patel, Carlyle, Raynsford, Holloway, Briars-Delve, Reilly, Tippetts, Lugger, Poyser, Noble, McLay, Blight, Dingle, Gilmour, Moore, Penrose, Ricketts, Sproston, Stephens, McNamara and Krizanac (50)

Abstain: (0)

Absent/Did not vote: Councillors Mrs Loveridge, Shayer, Hulme, Dr Cree, Bingley, Tofan, Finn (7)

37. **Impact of Vaping on Young People**

Councillor Mrs Beer proposed as amended the Motion and was seconded by Councillor Patrick Nicholson.

Councillor Aspinall proposed an amendment which was seconded by Councillor Sally Haydo, which Council passed.

Following contributions from Councillors Harrison, McLay and Gilmour Council agreed to:

1. To note that the Health and Wellbeing Board has established a Working Group to produce a joint response with partners on the issues around vaping and young people.
2. To write to Neil O'Brien MP Minister for Primary Care and Public Health to ask for the rapid publication of the review and consultation into Youth Vaping, with urgent implementation of the recommended measures, especially those aimed at reducing the appeal of vapes to children and young people.
3. To request that the Government ban single use Vapes, that are attractive to young people and that are causing littering and environmental concerns, lobby our 3 local MPs to take this message to government.
4. To encourage the City Council's Public Protection Department and trading standards to continue to undertake random test purchases across Plymouth, to catch those who do sell to young people under the age of 18 years.
5. To continue to encourage schools to engage with children and young people, and parents to ensure they know the risks that vaping has on young people and the developing mind.
6. To request all schools within Plymouth to ban vapes within their premises.

For: Councillors Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, Murphy, Penberthy, Rennie, Stevens, Tuffin, Tuohy, Mrs Beer, Darcy, Stoneman, Goslin, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Smith, Mrs Bridgeman, Laing, Ms Watkin, Wakeham, Cresswell, Partridge, Salmon, Harrison, Patel, Carlyle, Raynsford, Holloway, Briars-Delve, Reilly, Luggier, Poyser, Noble, McLay, Blight, Dingle, Gilmour, Moore, Penrose, Sproston, McNamara and Krizanac (46)

Abstain: (0)

Absent/Did not vote: Councillors Allen, Mrs Loveridge, Shayer, Hulme, Dr Cree, Bingley, Ricketts, Stephens, Tofan, Tippetts and Finn (11)

38. **Nursery Provision**

Councillor Sally Cresswell introduced the motion on Nursery Provision, which was seconded by Councillor John Stephens.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Harrison, Goslin and Mrs Beer, Council agreed to:

1. Note that the financial pressures on our nurseries had been increasing, which had become even more apparent with the cost of living crisis and inflation;
2. Ask The Leader to write to the new Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State (Minister for Children, Families and Wellbeing) David Johnston OBE MP to make him aware of the situation and its potential impact on Plymouth Families and Households with children. As well as the impact on Plymouth's local economy and the economic pressures being placed on nursery providers.

For (47)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Krizanac, Laing, Lowry, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Abstain (1)

Councillor Luggier.

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (4)

Councillors Hulme, Nicholson, Shayer and Tippetts.

39. **Online Meetings**

Councillor Eddie Rennie introduced the motion on Online Meetings, which was seconded by Councillor Bill Stevens.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Mrs Bridgeman, Mrs Beer, Penberthy, Stoneman, Penberthy and Nicholson, Council agreed to:

1. Support the petition launched by the Association of Democratic Services Officers / Lawyers in Local Government with regard to remote and hybrid meetings;
2. To request The Leader write to the Secretary of State for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities calling on the Government to respond to the call for evidence which closed two years ago and change the law to allow councils the flexibility to hold such meetings when they deem appropriate within agreed rules and procedures.

For (41)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Krizanac, Laing, Lowry, Luggier, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Salmon, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Tuffin, Tuohy, and Wakeham.

Abstain (6)

Councillors Darcy, Dr Mahony, Patel, Smith, Stoneman and Ms Watkin.

Against (1)

Councillor Ricketts.

Absent/Did Not Vote (4)
Councillors Holloway, Hulme, Shayer and Tippetts.

40. **The formation of a Strategic Working Group to progress the re-opening of Plymouth Airport**

Councillor Andy Lugger introduced the motion on the formation of a Strategic Working Group to progress the re-opening of Plymouth Airport, which was seconded by Councillor Bill Wakeham.

Councillor Tudor Evans OBE proposed an amendment, which was seconded by Councillor Lowry.

The meeting was adjourned for 10 minutes to allow members to consider the amendment.

Following contributions from Councillors Lugger and Mrs Bridgeman, Council agreed to accept the amendment.

For (47)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Krizanac, Laing, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Abstain (2)

Councillors Poyser and McLay.

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (3)

Councillors Hulme, Shayer and Tippetts.

Following further contributions from Councillors Poyser and Nicholson, Council agreed to recommend to Cabinet:

- I. To form a cross-party Strategic Working Group to further the re-opening of the site for aviation, subject to the successful acquisition of the land.

For (47)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Krizanac, Laing, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Abstain (0)

Against (2)
Councillors Poyser and McLay.

Absent/Did Not Vote (3)
Councillors Hulme, Shayer and Tippetts.

41. **Recognizing the Importance of Outdoor Play in Child Development and the Need for a City-Wide Play Strategy**

Councillor Lauren McLay introduced the motion on recognising the important of outdoor play in child development and the need for a city-wide play strategy, which was seconded by Councillor Poyser.

Following contributions from Councillors Dann, Briars-Delve, Noble, Harrison, Smith and Coker, Council agreed to:

- I. Note that:
 - a. A central aim of our current Corporate Plan is ‘to make Plymouth a great place to grow up and grow old’;
 - b. Outdoor play is crucial for children's overall development, fostering physical fitness, cognitive abilities, social skills, and emotional well-being. It promotes creativity, problem solving, and resilience, while also encouraging a healthy and active lifestyle;
 - c. Plymouth currently benefits from over 125 play parks, which cater to diverse age groups and offer various types of play equipment. These play areas are an essential community asset, contributing to the well-being of children and families across the city;
 - d. There is a need to build upon legacy schemes (Improving Plymouth Play and Improving Outdoor Play Programme) to ensure that we continue to improve and expand outdoor play opportunities for all children in Plymouth;
2. Note that by reviewing the city-wide play strategy:
 - a. Plymouth City Council would reaffirm its commitment to prioritise outdoor play as a key component of child development and well-being. And;
 - b. It would restate how having a comprehensive and well-considered city-wide play strategy, the Council can continue to attract external funding from various sources, maximizing the potential for investment in new and existing play facilities;
3. Resolved that the opportunity was taken to use the Plymouth Plan Review taking place in 2024 to ensure that play was embedded into the plan and that it then set a framework for a play delivery plan with targeted interventions. This action was to be included in the work programme of the relevant scrutiny committee.

For (43)
Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Blight, Briars-Delve, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, Luggar, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Noble, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Abstain (0)

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (9)

Councillors Mrs Beer, Mrs Bridgeman, Hulme, Krizanac, Nicholson, Partridge, Reilly, Shayer and Tippetts.

42. **Council Tax Exemption for Foster Carers**

Councillor Charlotte Carlyle introduced the motion on Council Tax exemption for foster carers, which was seconded by Councillor Ian Darcy.

Councillor Jemima Laing proposed that the matter was referred to the Education and Children's Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Laing, Lowry and Smith, Council agreed to:

- I. To refer the motion to the Education and Children's' Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee, to enable scrutiny of the detail of the proposal including which Foster Carers would be covered and the financial impact upon the Council.

For (41)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Blight, Briars-Delve, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, Luggar, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Noble, Patel, Penberthy, Poyser, Raynsford, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Abstain (0)

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (9)

Councillors Mrs Beer, Mrs Bridgeman, Hulme, Krizanac, Nicholson, Partridge, Penrose, Reilly, Shayer, Stevens, and Tippetts.

43. **Questions by Councillors**

	From	To	Subject
1	Councillor Allen	Councillor Laing	Had anyone moved into the new supported accommodation for care experienced young people and how was the project going?
			Response: 2 young people had moved in so far. Move-ins were being fazed to allow the young people to settle and have the best support from staff.
2	Councillor Patel	Councillor Coker	Where the improvements to St Budeaux square under TCF funding going to take place?
			Response: Alderman Wheeler had also been asking this question. The plans

	for the mobility hubs at the square were in progress, and he was hoping to sign them off in the coming weeks, and a bus shelter was included in that. He was happy to update Councillors Patel, Dingle and Haydon on any progress.		
3	Councillor Luggar	Councillor Allen	At the meeting of the Audit and Governance Committee held on 5 September 2022, the Committee agreed to consult the people of Plymouth on moving elections from 'by thirds' to 'all out elections', and on 21 November 2022, he had presented a report to Council and a consultation was agreed to take place between June and August 2023. He had also chaired a group who designed the questions and consultees. What had happened to this work.
	Response: She referred Councillor Luggar to her announcement earlier in the meeting regarding the electoral review.		
	Supplementary: Had it been an attempt to delay and stall the consultation?		
	Response: No.		
4	Councillor Stoneman	Councillor Briars-Delve	Did Councillor Briars-Delve agree that residents shouldn't be forced to walk on the road instead of the pavement?
	Response: He fully supported and encouraged active travel, including walking, so he welcomed that point of view.		
	Supplementary: What was Councillor Briars-Delve doing to instruct teams to clear vegetation from pavements across the city, following him and several colleagues sending in many examples where vegetation had forced residents to walk in the road?		
	Response: Casework on the issue was ongoing. There was going to be a proactive winter vegetation cut back starting in November 2023. It was important to get the timeline right to ensure that teams were managing priorities across the city.		
5	Councillor Dr Mahony	Councillor Coker	A number of his residents had enquired about what was happening at the North Road East Junction, as it had been remodelled, but following completion of works, it seemed not much had been done, other than a new left turn. Did Councillor Coker think that the delays, congestion and inconvenience had been worth it?
	Response: No one had expressed that opinion to him yet. He would be happy to discuss the matter in issue with officers and other ward councillor to get constructive feedback on the operation.		
	Supplementary: What was the cost of the project? Was it value for money?		
	Response: He did not have the information to hand but would provide the cost when they met to discuss the scheme.		
6	Councillor Wakeham	Councillor Briars-Delve	On 16 July, he had emailed Councillor Briars-Delve regarding rubbish in Thurlstone Walk and the surrounding area, with reports of rats, and asked to be informed when the rubbish had been cleared, but had not received a response.
	Response: He would look into it and get a response.		

7	Councillor Harrison	Councillor Briars-Delve	What was happening with regards to long grass after it had been cut, as large mounds of grass had been left? Was there a plan to collect it as it would prevent the grass underneath growing, and would eventually enter and block drains.
	Response: Regular grass cutting was ongoing. He asked for Councillors to photograph of individual cases and to report them.		
8	Councillor Poyser	Councillor Coker	He had taken a ride on a Beryl bike for £12.50, but a day rider bus ticket was just £5.50. Were there plans to make the Beryl bikes more affordable?
	Response: During car free day, there was going to be an incentive to get people onto Beryl bikes. They were competitively priced. The team would review usage after 6-8 months and then look at other incentives to promote sustainable transport.		
9	Councillor McLay	Councillor Briars-Delve	Chaddlewood playing fields and play equipment were not listed as a formal park on the Council website. Could it be made into a park?
	Response: He had had looked at this with officers and Chaddlewood open space was designated and maintained as a play space.		
10	Councillor Raynsford	Councillor Penberthy	What pans were in place when the Labour administration had come into power for improvements on the Firestone Bay pools?
	Response: Councillor Dann had introduced a £40,000 repair budget in the last Labour administrations; this was changed during the Conservative administrations and not spent on the pool. Therefore, there was a bigger problem to solve, as he had inherited poor quality plans for it.		
	Supplementary: Were there any plans in place to improve them?		
	Response: He had asked for specification to be drawn up for renovation and the staircase. The initial estimate had been promising and a decision would be made in the following weeks. He assured her that under the Labour administration in power, Firestone Bay tidal pool would be fixed.		
11	Councillor Smith	Councillor Lowry	What was happening with the wellbeing hub in Plymstock?
	Response: He would find out and get back to her with a response.		
	Supplementary: Would he put it as a priority to find out and to meet with her?		
Response: Yes.			
12	Councillor Dr Mahony	Councillor Laing	A resident had receive different replies to the same question from multiple departments, was that acceptable? Both responses had said the issue would be resolved, but it hadn't been.
	Response: If he sent her the details, she would look into it.		
13	Councillor Wakeham	Councillor Briars-Delve	SUDS project in Central Park was supposed to be completed in July 2023. When would the project be complete? How much extra would it cost?
	Response: It was included in the capital programme and had been reviewed that day in terms of cost and officers would continue to provide updates. It was important to get it right in order to look after nature.		

	Supplementary: What would the additional cost be?		
	Response: That had been covered within documents seen by Council at the meeting.		
14	Councillor Patel	Councillor Coker	Beryl bikes had been installed in Barne Barton and were well used. When would they be rolled out across the city?
	Response: The remaining sites had been presented to him last week and he had signed 90% off, with one site needing more information before approval. All sites were scheduled to finish on time and would be running by the end of the year.		
	Supplementary: Could they be fitted outside of St Budeaux Library?		
	Response: There was always an ability to review sites. He suggest Councillor Patel contacted the relevant officers.		

Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.