

## City Council

Monday 24 January 2022

### PRESENT:

Councillor Mrs Beer, in the Chair.

Councillor Mrs Bridgeman, Vice Chair.

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Churchill, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drear, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Singh, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Burden, Dr Cree, Deacon, Haydon, Mrs Johnson, Lowry, Morris and Vincent

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 7.18 pm.

*Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at [www.plymouth.gov.uk](http://www.plymouth.gov.uk). At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.*

### 17. Minutes

The minutes of 22 November 2021 (EGM) were confirmed as a true and correct record.

The minutes of 22 November 2021 City Council meeting was a true and correct record subject to the amendment to show Councillor Dr Cree present for motions 11, 12, 13 and 14.

### 18. Declarations of Interest

The following declarations of interest were made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in respect of items under consideration at the meeting –

Name	Minute Number	Reason	Interest
Councillor Penberthy	Climate Emergency Action Plan Minute 25	Plymouth Energy Community CBS (Director)  Plymouth Energy Community Renewables (Director)  Ernesettle Community Solar Ltd (Director)	Private

		Plymouth Energy Community Homes (Director)  Shareholder in Plymouth Energy Community Renewables	
Councillor Stoneman	Pay Policy Statement 2022/23 Minute 30	Relative works for Plymouth City Council	Private
Councillor McDonald	Climate Emergency Action Plan Minute 25	Shareholder in Plymouth Energy Community Renewables	Private
Councillor Mrs Bridgeman	Climate Emergency Action Plan Minute 25	Plymouth Energy Community Board Trustee Plymouth Energy Community Trust (trading as Plymouth Energy Community) (Trustee)	Private
Councillor Dr Mahony	Climate Emergency Action Plan Minute 25	Shareholder in Plymouth Energy Community Renewables	Private

19. **Appointments to Committees, Outside Bodies etc**

Members were advised of the following changes -

<b>Committee</b>	<b>Current</b>	<b>Proposed</b>
Brexit infrastructure and Legislative Change Overview and Scrutiny Committee	Councillor Bill Wakeham	Councillor Margaret Corvid
Performance Finance and Customer Services Overview and Scrutiny committee	Conservative Vacant	Councillor Jemima Laing
Child Poverty Working Group	Cllr Charlotte Carlisle	Cllr Natalie Harrison
Child Poverty Working Group	Councillor Andrea Loveridge	Councillor Phillip Partridge
Lord Mayor Selection Committee	Cllr Evans	Cllr Vincent

The Council noted the update.

20. **Questions by the Public**

There were three questions submitted by members of the public.

The following question was submitted by Ricky Lowes and answered by Councillor Mrs Maddi Bridgeman (Cabinet Member for Environment and Street Scene) –

Question: Given the Council's ambition to achieve Net Zero for Plymouth by 2030, what method of carbon accounting does the Council use, does it employ a carbon accountant and does its accounting include scope 3 emissions - e.g. those from imported goods?

Answer: I would like to start by saying that this Administration has kept faith with the overall strategic approach that was put in place on the back of the Climate Emergency Declaration unanimously agreed at the City Council meeting held on 18 March 2019. Since May 2021, and as we said in our manifesto, we will 'commit to improving the environment by creating innovative plans to make Plymouth carbon neutral by 2030'. As I have made clear at scrutiny committees on our climate action plans in July 2021 and December 2021, I am passionate about the strong monitoring of our actions. As well as developing future action plans to support our 2030 net zero target, a crucial part of responding to the Climate Emergency is the regular monitoring of emissions. So, I am pleased to say, your questions are very timely.

In relation to your question: What method of carbon accounting does the Council use? The scope of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions is a well-researched area. The most widely used definitions are those set by the Green House Gas Protocol (GHG Protocol), which establishes comprehensive global standardised frameworks to measure and manage greenhouse gas emissions from private and public sector operations, value chains and mitigation actions. These well-defined areas of scope are:

Scope 1 - All Direct Emissions from the activities of an organisation or under their control, including fuel combustion on site such as gas boilers, fleet vehicles and air-conditioning leaks.

	<p>Scope 2 – Indirect Emissions from any electricity, heat and steam purchased and used by the organisation. Emissions are created during the production of the energy and eventually used by the organisation.</p> <p>Scope 3 – All Other Indirect Emissions from activities of the organisation, occurring from sources that they do not own or control. These are usually the greatest share of the carbon footprint, covering emissions associated with business travel, procurement, waste and water. This methodology is used for both the Climate Emergency Action Plan and the Corporate Carbon Reduction Plan. The complexity of recording scope three emissions means it is not possible to monitor all of scope three emissions at this time. In relation to your question: Does it employ a carbon accountant in relation to the Climate Emergency Action Plan, the accounting and reporting of emissions is fully reliant on the Government’s national data provision. The Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy publishes several annual data sets in relation to the UK Local and Regional Carbon Dioxide Emissions Estimates. These data sets are interpreted by Exeter University who are commissioned annually by Plymouth City Council to provide an independent report, which details city wide emissions.</p> <p>Our Corporate Performance Team undertakes the accounting and reporting of emissions for the Corporate Carbon Reduction Plan. We have created a City Council Carbon Emissions Framework with our own bespoke dataset for our future corporate carbon reduction reporting This is completed utilising internally held data and applying nationally agreed carbon conversion factors. In relation to your question: Does its accounting</p>
--	--

	<p>include scope three emissions – for example - those from imported goods? Our Corporate Carbon Reduction Plan monitors scope three emissions from business travel - with the anticipation of collecting emissions from waste and water in 2022. Imported goods do not yet feature in our monitoring, though we have implemented a method of evaluating the carbon impact of services and products we purchase into our procurement process. Finally, The Climate Emergency Action Plan does not take into account scope three emissions.</p>
<p>The following question was submitted by Mr Howard Goffin and answered by Councillor John Riley (Cabinet Member for Governance, HR, IT and Community Safety) -</p>	
<p>Question: Recent headlines report how Authorities are moving away from election cycles ‘by thirds’ towards ‘whole Council’ elections. The majority of Unitary Authorities already practice whole Council elections. Acknowledging the financial and continuity benefits to less frequent election cycles, what is the rationale for PCC retaining a ‘by thirds’ model?</p>	<p>Answer: There are a number of arguments in favour of and against each system of elections. Arguments against elections by thirds include the extra costs and logistics of holding elections in three years out of four, and the potential impact on longer term decision making. Arguments in favour include the ability of the electorate to hold political parties to account on a more frequent basis, and the greater engagement with voters that this can encourage.</p> <p>In order to change a Council’s election arrangements, consultation must take place with electors and two thirds of all Councillors must agree to the change. Plymouth’s election arrangements are kept under review, and this Administration is exploring the option of a return to whole Council elections which will likely be the subject of further discussion over the coming year.</p>
<p>The following question was submitted by Mr Alex Spencer and answered by Councillor Nick Kelly (Leader of the Council) –</p>	

<p>Question: I have seen from Facebook pages that one of the two councillors for Chaddlewood, Cllr Collins, has taken a job in Gloucestershire. Does this mean that Chaddlewood will be represented by a councillor living over 100 miles from Plymouth for the next two years?</p>	<p>Answer: Plymouth City Council prides itself on having some outstanding Councillors from across the political spectrum, who do an excellent job in representing their communities and supporting the work of the Council. I would suggest that any Councillor whose personal circumstances have changed in such a way as to prevent them from serving their communities as they would wish, to reflect carefully on their ability to continue in the role.</p> <p>Detailed employment and living arrangements are a matter for individual Councillors, and it would not be appropriate for me to provide such information in a public forum, but the law is clear about the qualifications to be a Councillor – at Section 79 of the Local Government Act 1972. I can confirm that all Councillors currently serving the Council currently meet these legal requirements, whether or not they currently live in the City.</p>
---	---

## 21. **Announcements**

The Lord Mayor proposed to suspend the rules of procedure to allow the Director of Public Health, to provide an update on COVID-19 to Council and answer any questions that were submitted from Councillors.

Councillor Mrs Maddi Bridgeman (Deputy Lord Mayor) seconded the proposal and went to a vote.

Members voted unanimously in favour of the motion.

Ruth Harrell Director of Public Health attended the meeting virtually and provided an update.

The Lord Mayor made the following announcements to Members –

- (a) it was with sadness that she had to report to Council the death of former Councillor Brian Rider, who served in the Ham Ward for two terms in 1987 to 1995; he would be sadly missed and always warmly remembered by those that knew him;
- (b) Catherine Biscombe was presented with the Lord Mayor's Special Award

following her completion of seven marathons in seven countries in seven days; she raised a total of £4,700 for the Royal Marines Charity;

- (c) the Plymouth and District Bowel Cancer support group helped people suffering or recovering from bowel cancer or stoma; working with partners they had provided kits, including a change of clothes which would help those that found themselves in need of immediate assistance; Plymouth Railway Station was the first to provide these kits along with a private room.

Councillor Nick Kelly (Leader of the Council) made the following announcements to Council

-

- (d) National Marine Park Chief Executive Officer -

- an interim Chief Executive for the City's National Marine Park had been appointed;
- Elaine Hayes was an environmentalist with a brilliant track record of leading nature and conservation organisations and brought with her a vast wealth of knowledge and experience;
- the Council had some really exciting times ahead with a lot of different ambitions and projects to deliver in this sector; the Council wanted to plan for a more sustainable future but also inspire and enthuse its residents;

- (e) Shekinah -

- the Council had been working closely with Shekinah which was a charity organisation in Plymouth, that provided opportunities for people, who were experiencing all forms of homelessness and other challenges; they helped people to make meaningful changes in their lives with specialist support to address health issues, getting a home and learning new skills to lead to employment;
- with Shekinah, the Council was hoping to turn the empty Stonehouse Community Centre at Stonehouse Creek into a new type of community centre which would bring all types of services into one safe space; the new venture would offer -
  - ◇ skills training;
  - ◇ health promotion;
  - ◇ education;
  - ◇ employment services;
  - ◇ housing advice;
  - ◇ mental health support;

◇ counselling;

- Shekinah had an incredible track record of changing lives of many Plymouth people and were keen to support them in any way that the Council could; this move would bring a new lease of life to a current vacant building but also meant that the Council could continue with its long term goal to regenerate Millbay; the new boulevard had really opened up the area and with a new hotel being built, this meant this was all good news for the City, the economy and residents;

(f) Omicron grants -

- Plymouth hospitality, leisure and accommodation businesses that had been impacted by Covid-19 would now be able to apply for further financial support through the Council;
- the Government announced the new Omicron Hospitality and Leisure grants on 21 December 2021, to help support businesses in this sector that had been impacted over the Christmas and New Year period;
- the team had worked quickly to get this latest business grant scheme up and running; the Council was now working on plans for the discretionary grant scheme as it wanted to make sure that it understood where the support was really needed most and how it could make sure the funding available had the best impact;

(g) Historic England grant -

- the Council had also received the news that Historic England would be giving it an increase in the existing High Street Heritage Action Zone Grant; the Council would receive an extra £130k for the historic enhancements project within Old Town Street and New George Street;
- this was excellent news to help the delivery of this important project within the city centre;

(h) Tamar Bridge Petition -

- the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry provided vital transport links between Devon and Cornwall and many residents, businesses and visitors were reliant on these links;
- efforts had been made repeatedly to lobby Government for support for general maintenance and improvements in line with Health and Safety measures;



- the Council was fully aware of how important this was, and had made it one of its commitments, Commitment 55 ‘consult you about the possibility of reducing or abolishing the tolls on the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry crossings by lobbying the Government to secure similar status to the Severn Bridge crossing’;
  - the Council was keen to use the power of the people so the continued cost was not a burden on local council taxpayers;
  - 100,000 signatures would be considered for debate in parliament; 10,000 signatures would receive a response from the Government; the Council wanted to show that it genuinely represented local people;
- (i) White Ribbon -
- in recent weeks he had met with a number of local organisations who provided vital and valuable support to victims of violence against women and girls in Plymouth; all had emphasised that the Council must take this issue seriously, and it did;
  - a Violence Against Women and Girls Commission had been established and it was working at pace under the leadership of Councillor Rebecca Smith; the Leader thanked Councillor Smith and all the Commission members including Nazir Afzal for getting this moving so quickly; everyone was encouraged to take a moment to complete the Commission’s survey which was currently on the Council’s website;
  - however, work must not stop whilst the Commission scrutinised what was being done in the City and what needed to happen in the future; there was a huge programme of projects and activities being delivered under the Council’s safer streets programme; the Council also needed to look at its own services and operations; therefore it was being announced today that the Council would be moving forward with its plans to achieve White Ribbon accreditation;
  - achieving White Ribbon status as an organisation would further demonstrate that the Council was best placed to help its residents in combating violence against women and girls and it must champion this important issue; Council staff continued to work tirelessly for its residents and this accreditation would demonstrate and enhance the skills and knowledge of its workforce in addressing violence in its communities.

Councillor Drear (Cabinet Member for Transport) made the following announcements to Council –

(j) Transforming Cities Fund Programme -

- two key contracts had been agreed for the flagship Plymouth Mobility Hubs project;
- a contract had been signed with Beryl Bikes to provide a network of electric bikes that would become operational across the City in 2023, with over 400 electric bikes being available for hire by local people;
- 300 parking bays across the City would be installed with electric vehicle charging points provided by Gamma Energy Limited; over 100 of these would have rapid chargers, capable of providing a typical electric vehicle with an additional 100 mile range in approximately 30 minutes;
- the tender process had been completed for the e-car club element of the Mobility Hubs programme;
- the Mobility Hubs project would provide much needed low carbon travel options for the people of Plymouth and clearly helped support the Council's climate ambitions;

(k) electric vehicle charging -

- from today, Plymouth City Council had started an exciting venture to increase the use of electric vehicles in the City;
- whilst for the majority of people, this would be an easy transformation, the Council had taken into account both residents and visitors who may have a mobility impairment and would find this less straight forward; it could be difficult for a wheelchair user to plug in the heavy cables used to charge the vehicles;
- the Parking Team had recognised this need and from today a trial would start in the Theatre Royal car park; the assisted electric vehicle charging scheme would allow car park users with a mobility impairment to park in an electric vehicle charging bay and use the telephone number to seek assistance from the staff on duty;
- the success of the scheme would be assessed over the coming months and in consultation with the Council's city wide partners, this scheme would be replicated where feasible; further support works had been undertaken with the disabled community and this would be followed up with more initiatives;

(l) Transforming Cities Fund 2 -

- the Council was working closely with the Department for Transport in developing a new CCTV control room, that would bring together the Traffic Signal Control team and the wider CCTV city surveillance arrangements;
- this would see new hardware and software to future proof the service and would see development of key partnerships in sustainable transport and enforcement to help make Plymouth safer and develop a more efficient transport network;

(m) social prescription of walking and cycling -

- Plymouth City Council had been awarded £80k by the Department for Transport to progress plans to encourage more people to take up walking and cycling for their health and wellbeing;
- the funding would be used for a feasibility study into 'social prescribed' walking and cycling, where health providers, link workers and community groups worked together to help people meet their personal activity needs and goals;
- the Council's transport and public health teams would be working with partners across the City, over the next few months, to put together a proposal that would aim to get more people walking and cycling and enjoying the health and wellbeing benefits they brought;
- if successful, Plymouth would receive funding for a three-year pilot programme that would help more people to access support, such as adult cycle training, led rides, led walks and complementary programmes like bike maintenance courses and workshops;
- the funding for the feasibility programme followed two competitive bidding rounds, with Plymouth being one of the highest scoring councils in the last round;

(n) George Park and Ride -

- the George Park and Ride passenger facility would re-open; the terminal building would be open on 31 January 2022; the building would be open Monday to Friday (except bank holidays) from 6.30 am to 3pm and would be staffed by Plymouth Citybus;
- the responsibility of the staff on site would include but not limited to providing information to customers on all modes of sustainable transport, general oversee of bus services, cleaning

the building and litter picking the car park, dealing with customer feedback and passing it on to the relevant body, reporting any site difficulties and passing it on to the relevant body and ensuring compliance with Covid 19 restrictions were maintained;

- unfortunately, at present, the building would not be able to be open on Saturdays but longer hours would be opened up, as soon as the Council was able to do so, especially with larger events in the city taking place;

(o) City bus shelter contract -

- this contract had gone out to tender on 14 January 2022 with a view to awarding it at the end of May 2022; Councillors had been sent an email regarding this matter (relating to the Wards affected);
- the key requirements from the new contract would be to provide high quality infrastructure, meeting accessible standards, move to digitalised advertising, maintenance and cleaning of the infrastructure, environmental and social consideration including green routes and environmental lighting and the Council receiving a share of the advertising revenue;

(p) Morlaix Drive Access Improvement Scheme -

- this scheme would help public transport access Derriford Hospital and would take just over a year to complete;
- Morlaix Drive was currently a narrow, 300m stretch of road that linked Brest Road and Derriford Hospital and provided access to the Glenbourne Unit, the ambulance station, the Thornbury Centre and access to the multi-storey car park; the road in part was too narrow for two way traffic; a bus gate would be installed to improve the self-sustainability of the bus services.

Councillor Mrs Vivienne Pengelly (Cabinet Member for Homes and Communities) made the following announcements to Council –

(q) Holocaust Memorial Day -

- Holocaust Memorial Day remembered the six million Jews murdered during the holocaust and it also commemorated and remembered the millions of other people killed under Nazi persecution and in subsequent genocides in Cambodia, Rwanda, Bosnia and Darfur;
- the Holocaust Memorial Day was marked annually by Plymouth

City Council as a civic event; this year the Council would mark the Holocaust Memorial Day with a civic commemoration ceremony with civic dignitaries and a public commemoration;

- the Association for Jewish Refugees had been very kind in providing a tree which would be planted opposite the Peace Garden, as part of the '80 Trees for 80 Years' campaign to help mark this occasion;
- an invitation was extended to everyone to join the public commemoration in the Peace Garden on the Hoe, at 11.15am on Thursday 27 January 2022;
- the Council had worked closely with Plymouth Centre for Faith and Culture Diversity to organise these events and took this opportunity to thank them for their commitment.

Councillor Mark Deacon (Cabinet Member for Customer Services, Culture, Leisure and Sport) made the following announcement to Council -

(r) Library Service -

- the Schools Library Service was pleased to report that over the Christmas and New Year period, 600 topic boxes had been collected from schools and a further 400 topic boxes had been delivered; each of these topic boxes contained a collection of 25 books on a related topic that school staff used to enhance learning.

*(Due to technical issues, Councillor Mark Deacon was unable to complete his announcements to Council).*

Councillor Chaz Singh (Chair of the Taxi Licensing Committee) made the following announcement to Council –

- (s) there would be no increases in Private Hire or Hackney Carriage fees for 2022/23;
- (t) he considered that this was a good opportunity to encourage individuals to apply to become a taxi driver to serve the City and its visitors, as the Council was currently experiencing a decrease in the number of taxi drivers;
- (u) he wished to thank the Vice Chair and Committee members of the Taxi Licensing Committee, as well as officers and staff that had been involved.

## 22. **Council Tax Base Setting 2022/23 and Council Tax Support Scheme 2022/23**

Councillor Nick Kelly (Leader of the Council) introduced the Council Tax Base Setting 2022/23 and Council Support Scheme 2022/23. This was seconded by Councillor Mrs Vivienne Pengelly.

Following a discussion the Council agreed –

- (1) the Council Tax Base for 2022/23 of 73,830 equivalent Band D dwellings as set out in the report;
- (2) the continuation of the current Council Tax Support scheme and Exceptional Hardship Scheme for 2022/23 with no update.

For (46)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Cllr Carlyle, Churchill Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain (1) Lord Mayor

23. **Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Future Financing**

Councillor Jonathan Drean (Cabinet Member for Transport) introduced the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Future Financing report. This was seconded by Councillor Pat Patel.

Following a discussion the Council agreed –

- (1) the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee's preferred option for toll revision of uniform 30% toll increased on both Tag and cash tolls for all user classes be approved; such approval to be subject to the Joint Committee making a decision whether or not to implement the preferred option following consideration of the public consultation responses; the Joint Committee being given the authority to make the implementation decision;
- (2) though the Portfolio Holders and Joint Chairs of the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee, continue to lobby Government and support a Users' Campaign for a fair contribution towards maintaining the A38 across the Tamar Bridge to reduce the burden on the user.

Without intervention, the undertaking's reserves would be fully depleted by the end of 2022/23 and the resulting deficit would fall on the parent authorities. The income would allow the continued delivery of safe, reliable and efficient cross of the Tamar.

For (44)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Churchill, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain (3) Councillors Hulme, Neil and Lord Mayor.

24. **Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry 2022-2023 Revenue and Capital Estimates**

Councillor Jonathan Drean (Cabinet Member for Transport) introduced the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry 2022/23 Revenue and Capital Estimates. This was seconded by Councillor Pat Patel.

Following a discussion the Council agreed –

- (1) the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee Annual Business Plan and the 2022/23 Revenue Estimates and Capital Programme.

For (46)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Churchill, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkins and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain (1) Lord Mayor.

25. **Climate Emergency Action Plan 2022**

Councillor Mrs Maddi Bridgeman (Cabinet Member for Environment and Street Scene) introduced the Climate Emergency Action Plan 2022. This was seconded by Councillor Sue Dann.

Following a discussion the Council agreed to support and endorse the Climate Emergency Action Plan 2022.

For (46)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Churchill, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald,

Murphy, Neil, Nicolson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain (1) Lord Mayor.

26. **Corporate Carbon Reduction Plan 2022**

Councillor Mrs Maddi Bridgeman (Cabinet Member for Environment and Street Scene) introduced the Corporate Carbon Reduction Plan 2022. This was seconded by Councillor Sue Dann.

Following a discussion the Council agreed to support and endorse the Corporate Carbon Reduction Action Plan 2022.

For (45)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drear, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicolson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain/Not present (2) the Lord Mayor and Councillor Churchill.

27. **Appointment of External Auditor**

Councillor Nick Kelly (Leader of the Council) introduced the Appointment of the External Auditor. This was seconded by Councillor Dr John Mahony.

Following a discussion the Council agreed to accept the Public Sector Audit Appointments' (PSAA) invitation to opt into the sector-led option for the appointment of external auditors to principal local government and police bodies for five financial years from 1 April 2023.

For (45)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drear, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicolson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain /Not present (2) the Lord Mayor and Councillor Churchill.

28. **Audit and Governance Committee Terms of Reference**



Councillor Dr John Mahony (Chair of the Audit and Governance Committee) introduced the Audit and Governance Committee Terms of Reference. This was seconded by Councillor John Riley.

Following a discussion the Council agreed to approve the adoption of the CIPFA model terms of reference outlined at appendix I with the inclusion of the overview of the Council's family of companies (2.11) and the ethical framework (7).

For (45)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicolson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain/Not present (2) the Lord Mayor and Councillor Churchill.

29. **Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee - Change to the Terms of Reference**

Councillor Jonathan Drean (Cabinet Member for Transport) introduced the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee, change to Terms of Reference. This was seconded by Councillor Pat Patel.

Following a discussion the Council agreed the changes to the Terms of Reference as agreed by the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee on the 1 October 2021 and Audit and Governance Committee on 29 November 2021.

For (45)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicolson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain/Not present (2) the Lord Mayor and Councillor Churchill.

30. **Pay Policy Statement 2022/23**

Councillor John Riley (Cabinet Member for Governance, HR, IT and Community Safety) introduced the Pay Policy Statement for 2022/23. This was seconded by Councillor Patrick Nicholson.

Following a discussion the Council agreed to approve the Pay Policy Statement for 2022/23. The policy sets out the Council's policies in respect of remuneration and is a statutory requirement.

For (45)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicolson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain/Not present (2) the Lord Mayor and Councillor Churchill.

31. **Plympton St Mary Ward's Polling Districts, Polling Places and Polling Stations Review 2021/2022 (To Follow)**

Councillor John Riley (Cabinet Member for Governance, HR, IT and Community Safety) introduced the Plympton St Mary Ward's Polling District, Polling Places and Polling Station Review 2021/22. This was seconded by Councillor Patrick Nicholson.

Following a discussion the Council agreed to –

- (1) approve the proposed changes to polling districts set out in Plympton St Mary's Ward, polling districts RB and RC only, set out in the Polling Districts and Polling Places Review (recommendations report at appendix A);
- (2) note the proposed changes to polling stations set out in the Polling Districts and Polling Places Review (recommendations report at appendix A).

For (45)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicolson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Against (0)

Abstain/Not present: (2) the Lord Mayor and Councillor Churchill.

32. **Calendar of Meetings 2022/23 (To Follow)**

Councillor John Riley (Cabinet Member for Governance, HR, IT and Community Safety) introduced the Plymouth City Council Committee Meeting Dates 2022/23. This was seconded by Councillor

Following a discussion the Council agreed to note the dates for meetings to be held in 2022 and 2023.

## MOTIONS ON NOTICE

### 33. Violence Against Women and Girls Commission

Councillor Mrs Vivienne Pengelly (Cabinet for Member Homes and Communities) introduced the cross party motion on notice on Violence Against Women and Girls Commission. This was seconded by Councillor Jemima Laing.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Kevin Neil, James Stoneman, Rebecca Smith, Dr Pam Buchan, Jeremy Goslin, Charlotte Carlyle, Chaz Singh, David James, Bill Wakeham, Sue Dann, Natalie Harrison, Glen Jordan, Margaret Corvid and Jemima Laing.

For (45)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Carlyle, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Downie, Dreaan, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Neil, Nicolson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Singh, Shayer, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tuffin, Wakeham, Ms Watkin, Wheeler and Mrs Beer (Lord Mayor).

Against (0)

Abstain/Not present: (1) Councillor Churchill.

### 34. Questions by Councillors

	From	To	Subject
1	Councillor Andrea Loveridge	Councillor Mrs Maddi Bridgeman	As restrictions are being lifted on Thursday, could an update be given on whether staff at Chelson Meadow can assist the general public with heavy bulky waste?
	Response: Members of staff at Chelson Meadow had helped members of the public that were struggling to dispose of their bulky waste at the facility. A risk assessment was currently being undertaken and an email would be sent to Councillor Loveridge providing an update.		
2	Councillor Pat Patel	Councillor Mark Deacon	What plans do the Council have going forward to return to a full library service from next year?
	Response: The Customer Service Team had been asked how much it would cost to restore the libraries to their full opening hours. It would cost £457k to		

	<p>restore the library opening hours. Efficiency savings would need to be made in the future, as had been done in previous years. The continued restrictions that Covid had placed upon the service had been awful and that was why the library service had not fully opened.</p> <p>Due to social distancing, only a proportion of personal computers could be open. Meeting rooms could not be opened due to the lack of ventilation. The library staff had reconfigured the layout of the libraries. Customers were encouraged not to stay too long due to the Covid rules. Covid grants had been received from the Government.</p> <p>At the start of Councillor Deacon's tenure, he had been asked to protect the library service which had been done whilst struggling with the lack of resources that had been inherited and the continuing demands that Covid brought. However, despite this, the opening hours of the Southway Library had increased.</p> <p>Supplementary: exactly when did Councillor Deacon envisage a progression to a return to a fuller library service and the reinstatement of such things as holiday activity clubs, story-telling and job clubs?</p> <p>Supplementary response: It was clear that libraries all over the country were in a state of flux and libraries in Plymouth were no different. There were not many cities of Plymouth's size that had 11 libraries located throughout the city and the suburbs. Most councils had drastically cut back on their library services. They had also combined them with different Council services to make their customer services more efficient, responsive to customer needs and environmentally greener. This was something that Councillor Deacon was keen to bring to Plymouth but this had been delayed.</p> <p>In future the way the Council operated its library model may have to be looked at. After this had been done, Councillor Deacon envisaged a library model that would be different but more comprehensive offering holiday clubs, story-telling and memory cafes. Libraries would open after March 2022.</p>		
3	Councillor Glen Jordan	Councillor Jonathan Drean	A number of taxi drivers had contacted Councillor Jordan raising concerns at the number of cars that were parked in taxi ranks. Could an explanation be given as to what was going on and what the Council was doing to combat this?
	Response: The Plymouth Licensed Taxi Association (PLTA) had provided Councillor Drean with photographic evidence of cars parking in taxi ranks. The enforcement teams had been out across the City. A total number of 250 PCNs had been issued for those people parking in taxi bays that should not have been there. This was an ongoing operation in the city centre and other locations outside of the city centre.		
4	Councillor Chaz Singh	Councillor Nick Kelly	Looking back at some recent statistics from the Census in 2001 and 2011 there had been a double increase in members of Black, Asian and Minority

			<p>Ethnic communities. Given Councillor Singh's experience of anti-Sikhism in Plymouth from the Plymouth Labour Group and the current situation with Nusrat Ghani in the Conservative Party, how will the Leader ensure that members of minority (answer unfinished due to point of order).</p> <p>Councillor Evans OBE Point of Order: Was it in order for Councillor Singh to imply falsely again, that he was subject to anti-Sikhism? He was not subject to anti- Sikhism, he was asked to moderate his inappropriate behaviour against senior members of other authorities. He persists to make these allegations without foundation and it would be wrong if he were allowed to continue to do this in a public forum.</p> <p>Lord Mayor: Councillor Evans OBE, this is not a Point of Order.</p>
	Response: No response was provided.		
5	Councillor James Stoneman	Councillor Jonathan Drean	In the last Full Council meeting, Councillor Drean stated that the trial for vehicle free school zones was going well. Were there any plans to roll anymore of these out throughout this year?
	Response: There were plans to roll more of the vehicle free school zones out across the City. This would be happening later in the year (2022). An update response would be provided to Councillor Stoneman outside of this forum.		
6	Councillor Chaz Singh	Councillor Nick Kelly	What assurances could the Leader of the Council provide members of diverse communities who would be looking at putting themselves forward as potential candidates, in the up-coming elections?
	<p>Response: The Council was actively encouraging all faiths, religions and nationalities to come and visit Plymouth to make it their home and Councillor Kelly was very pleased that this Conservative Administration had appointed Councillor Singh as Chair of the Equalities and Diversity Committee to ensure that minority groups were represented and their views and thoughts were very much considered and acted upon, in terms of diversity.</p> <p>With regards to people putting themselves forward as candidates to be Plymouth City Councillors, he would actively encourage any person that met the eligibility criteria and who felt passionate about their city and their local community to step forward.</p> <p>Councillor Kelly was not aware of a huge amount of issues. He appreciated Councillor Singh's personal experiences had not been particularly great and that</p>		

	<p>they had been well documented but in terms of this Conservative Administration and this Council, Councillor Kelly thought that with the Committee that had been set up with Councillor Singh as Chair, recent meetings with the Romanian community, that had been invited to the Council House (the honour and privilege of talking to a lot of those groups) and Hanukkah had been celebrated outside of the Council House, these were very clear steps forward that this City, Council and Conservative Administration had made in ensuring that everybody felt valued. The greater diversity that this City had made it a richer and better tapestry for its economy and its future.</p>		
7	<p>Councillor Jemima Laing</p>	<p>Councillor Mrs Pengelly</p>	<p>As Portfolio Holder with responsibility for the issue of violence against women and girls, especially following the earlier important debate with excellent contributions from Councillors, did Councillor Mrs Pengelly agree with Councillor Laing that Councillor Kelly's continued silence undermined the assertion that this issue was a priority and that the Conservative Group took this issue seriously (Councillor Kelly had been readmitted to the Conservative Group with no apology or response to a letter from women Councillors following his remarks which caused enormous offense locally and nationally. Councillor Kelly could have contributed to the debate today and apologised).</p>
<p>Response: No I do not agree.</p> <p>Supplementary: Are you able to give an explanation of how your Party decided Councillor Kelly was forgiven for those remarks after an investigation had taken place and the findings had been kept secret?</p> <p>Supplementary response: I am not responsible for what other people do or say.</p>			
8	<p>Councillor Tudor Evans OBE</p>	<p>Councillor Patrick Nicholson</p>	<p>Following a weekend knocking on many doors across Plymouth, he was unable to find one person that had been aware that in a few weeks' time the Conservative Government would be re-introducing prescription charges for people aged between 60 and 66. Did Councillor Nicholson agree with the Government's policy?</p>
<p>Response: Clearly this was a national Government decision (Councillor Nicholson was unaware of this change in policy). Ultimately we in local government had to adhere to the parliamentarians, so it was a matter that clearly the Government decided on and one that unfortunately needed to be adhered to at a local level. He was here to assist and run the local government services and if people were concerned then they should take this up with their MPs.</p> <p>Supplementary: Would Councillor Nicholson on behalf of every 60 to 66 year old in the City of Plymouth inform the Government and the local MPs that</p>			

	<p>Plymouth would not meekly accept Government policy when it was wrong. The people that would suffer the most from this policy were the people with long term health conditions that had to have regular medication and this was basically a health tax on them. So would Councillor Nicholson help to campaign to stop this health tax being introduced in the next few weeks?</p> <p>Supplementary response: I am very happy to make representation to local MPs and express the concerns that are being raised. There are means tests for those that could not afford to pay but he was more than happy to raise this issue.</p>		
9	Councillor Philip Partridge	Councillor Jonathan Drean	Was it possible to add parking on pavements a fineable offence on their PDAs?
	<p>Response: Legislation was due from Westminster, so that local authorities could make this enforceable in the future. At the moment this legislation had not arrived. There were lots of people, whether in wheelchairs or mobility scooters that were forced to drive on the road because there were cars blocking the pavement, so this issue was being looked into. Councillor Drean was happy to respond to Councillor Partridge with an update.</p>		
10	Councillor Chaz Singh	Councillor Dr John Mahony	As an unregistered data controller should an elected member breach the Data Protection Act would all councillors be covered under insurance from the Council or could they all be individually prosecuted as a criminal act?
	<p>Response: Members could be subject to a claim for breach of Data Protection legislation where they were acting as a Data Controller in their own right. In general terms, if acting as a Ward Councillor and an email was received and you forwarded it to someone within the Council network that should not be an issue.</p> <p>If there was sensitive material the Councillor may wish to ask for permission and if an email was being sent outside of the Council family. Councillors were included in the list of entities to be indemnified under the Council's liability policies which extended to provide cover for Data Protection breaches should there be a legal liability attached. Any deliberate acts or omissions would not be covered.</p> <p>Supplementary: If a breach occurred from a Councillor's email was it a breach by the Council or was it a breach by the Councillor?</p> <p>Supplementary response: When it came to the processing of data, Councillors had three different roles. They represented their ward and in this capacity they were controllers in their own right, separate from the Council. Secondly, Councillors act as Members of the Council, for example as Cabinet Member or Members of the Committee and in this capacity the Council was either solely or jointly a controller with Councillors. Thirdly Councillors could act as Members of a political party and in this capacity they were again controllers in their own right, separate from the Council. It would therefore depend on the relevant circumstances surrounding any breach, as to the capacity that a Councillor was</p>		

	acting in and whether there was also a breach by the Council.		
11	Councillor Jeremy Goslin	Councillor Mark Deacon	In response to Councillor Deacon's prepared answer, he gave to a previous question outlining plans for improvements for modification to the Library Service. Could he give assurance that as part of any future plans that the Conservative Administration, the Council would not see any further closures of local libraries across the City? Could he give that assurance?
<p>Response: Councillor Deacon was unable to give an assurance but he would resist any closures to libraries, as far as he was responsible for the service. Hopefully there would not be any closures.</p> <p>Supplementary: Since Councillor Deacon was the Cabinet Member with control of the Library Service, then surely he would not need to resist these plans. Would Councillor Deacon give those assurances that no local libraries would be changed under plans for modifications to the service under the Conservative Administration? Can Councillor Deacon give that assurance yes or no?</p> <p>Supplementary response: Work would take place later this year regarding possible changes to how the Council delivered the Library Service. Councillor Deacon positively said that he did not envisage any library closures.</p>			
12	Councillor Pauline Murphy	Councillor Mark Deacon	I asked a question at the last Full Council meeting as to why no poppies were put out across the City and for Remembrance and Councillor Deacon had requested that I email him. An email was set and a response was still awaited. Does Councillor Deacon feel that the Armed Forces community did not deserve a response?
<p>Response: Councillor Deacon was deeply respectful of the Armed Forces and the services they provide. The lack of poppies in the Citadel was the responsibility of the Lord Mayor's Office and was not in his portfolio.</p> <p>Supplementary: If Councillor Deacon was aware of this, he could have still responded to Councillor Murphy's email to inform her of that fact. Councillor Deacon was the Portfolio Holder for events, so he would have been involved. When would Councillor Murphy receive a response to her question?</p> <p>Supplementary response: Councillor Deacon had asked the Events Team to respond to Councillor Murphy but if they had not, he would ask them to respond. Councillor Deacon reiterated that he had every respect for the Armed Services in Plymouth and the country.</p>			



13	Councillor Eddie Rennie	Councillor Jonathan Drean	The roads in Mount Gould were of a third world standard with repairs falling apart, would Councillor Drean come around and look at the roads and respond to residents' concerns?
	Response: Councillor Drean was happy to visit the site and he would bring an inspector with him as he was not qualified on the technical side of assessing defects, (he would arrange something in diaries).		
14	Councillor Chaz Singh	Councillor Rebecca Smith	He had received emails from people across the City relating to the development at Green Bank where a storey had been over-built. How far had enforcement been progressed?
	Response: Councillor Singh had received an email from planning enforcement (in a timely manner). Councillor Smith was concerned about this development and it was on her radar.		
15	Councillor Sarah Allen	Councillor Dave Downie	In relation to the issue of Covid 19 measures in schools, how many ventilators had been allocated to Plymouth schools?
	Response: The number of ventilators nationally was limited. Councillor Downie had spoken to the Director of Education and he was not aware of any of them being situated in Plymouth schools.		
	Supplementary: This seems like Plymouth was being left behind and asked that the Council seek to bid for ventilators.  Supplementary response: Plymouth was not being left behind. There were 6000 ventilators nationally and Councillor Downie was unaware if there was a need for them in Plymouth schools. The current guidance was to continue to wear masks and open windows but these guidelines could change this week.		
16	Councillor Chaz Singh	Councillor Mrs Maddi Bridgeman	His ward and the City had huge amounts of fly tipping across it and he had noticed there had been an increase in enforcement. Would Councillor Mrs Bridgeman be looking at operating a zero tolerance on fly tipping?
	Response: There had been an increase in the fixed penalty notices to £150 due to the continued drive to tackle environmental crimes, littering, graffiti and fly posting. Everyone could keep up to date with enforcement activities through the Environmental Enforcement Facebook page on the Council's website. There was a lot information on these pages, as well as information on the cases that the Council had taken to court. There was no need for fly tipping as the bulky waste collections were back and the Council was really clamping down on this activity. There had been a slight glitch with recruitment but the team was working incredibly hard. (Figures were available which would be forwarded to Councillor Singh outside of this forum).  Supplementary: Given that you have increased the fines, has there been an		

	increase or decrease in fly tipping across the City?		
	Supplementary response: This was a recent decision and had only been to Cabinet a couple of weeks ago. It was therefore hoped that the increase would be a positive move.		
17	Councillor Jemima Laing	Councillor Dave Downie	It is quite glib to say just open the windows, we are in the middle of some very cold weather, we have been in here this afternoon and the windows are not open and it's freezing. Could I therefore ask that you make the case for Plymouth to get an allocation of these ventilation systems? Please could you make the case for Plymouth schools that need them?
	Response: Certainly, let me clarify, I was not being glib, I was actually just reiterating Government information and guidelines.		
	Supplementary: What action might be taken to make the case for ventilation systems in Plymouth schools, if other schools were getting them in other cities?		
	Supplementary response: I am sure that the Director of Education had actually lobbied and had put in bids for the ventilators.		
18	Councillor Sue McDonald	Councillor Dave Downie	It makes no sense to me why there are four or five times as many schools as there are ventilators. I do not understand the rationale behind this policy at all and I would welcome some information, as this must be completely randomised because I cannot see the logic in the number of schools in Plymouth and in other cities. Could you look more into this matter as it is a crazy policy?
	Response: A response would be provided.		
19	Councillor Tudor Evans OBE	Councillor Dave Downie	I am intrigued by Councillor Downie's statement and I would like to make sure that it is absolutely on the record that there were 7000 ventilator systems (air conditioning units) that were promised to cover the entirety of the UK and was it correct that Plymouth had not been allocated a single one?
	Response: that is my recollection of my last conversation with the Director of Education.		
	Supplementary: What efforts were the Cabinet making to ensure that the MPs for this City were raising this issue as a matter of urgency? Can a review of the bids be made in order to find out why they had been unsuccessful? Are Plymouth children's lives not worth it, as other children's in other cities?		
	Supplementary response: An appropriate response would be provided to		

	Councillor Evans OBE, as soon as Councillor Downie was able to do so.
--	---

*Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.*