

PARKING MODERNISATION AND ENVIRONMENT PLAN

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1. This report presents a number of proposals as part of a Parking Modernisation and Environmental Plan. This Plan sets the scene to enable a fresh look at the next phase of Plymouth's modernisation of parking and the role of parking in supporting the city's response to climate change.

1.2. A range of proposals have been considered with the following objectives:

- Improve customer experience, the customer journey and access to services;
- Demonstrate our values as a Responsible Council in responding to the climate emergency.
- Support the Councils £9.8M investment in mobility hubs as part of a wider £58.8M Transforming Cities investment to encourage modal shift and a step change in our sustainable transport offer.
- Support the wider strategy for economic recovery and the city's recovery from COVID-19;
- Respond to the financial impact of COVID-19 on income, income critical to the delivery of key services

1.3. The Parking Modernisation and Environment Plan supports our Councils values: -

- **Democratic** – Plymouth is a place where people can have their say about what is important to them and where they are empowered to make change happen;
- **Responsible** – We are responsible for our actions; we are accountable for their impact on others and the environment and expect others to do the same;
- **Fair** – We will be honest and open in how we act. We will treat everyone with respect, champion fairness and create opportunities;
- **Collaborative** – We will provide strong community leadership, working with residents, communities, and businesses to deliver our common ambition.

1.4. The Parking Modernisation and Sustainability Plan supports our corporate priorities, specifically:

- Support a green, sustainable city that cares about the environment;
- Create a vibrant economy, developing quality jobs and skills;
- Create a varied, efficient, sustainable transport network;
- Create a friendly welcoming city.

2. BACKGROUND

2.1. The Councils Parking Service generates income to the Council, covering all service costs and contributing a key income stream to support the delivery our Highway Services; this includes the maintenance of the city's roads and streets. Whilst continuing to cover all service costs, COVID-19 has had a significant impact on parking revenue, where income remains below levels previously experienced pre-COVID-19, placing pressures on service delivery within the Highways Service.

2.2. Parking fees and charges have not been subject to increase, inflationary or otherwise, in the last **5 years** (2017) and, in the case of residents' permits, **14 years** (2008). Benchmarking identifies some of Plymouth's fees to some of the lowest available. Despite no increases to fees and charges, service costs have increased, and income streams become more challenged.

3. CURRENT POSITION

- 3.1. The latest budget position (June 22) is forecasting a 2022/23 pressure of £405k on parking revenue, which is further to an existing £848k reduction applied to the parking accounts in 2022/23 in response to the impact of COVID-19 on income.
- 3.2. To better understand current trends and markets, benchmarking was undertaken in June 22 with 26 other Councils (**Appendix A**) as part of the 'Key Cities' group in relation to On Street, Off Street and Residents Parking (*Birmingham, Blackpool, Bournemouth, Brighton, Bristol, Cambridge, Canterbury, Cardiff, Cornwall, Coventry, Derby, Doncaster, Exeter, Liverpool, Manchester, Newcastle, Newham, Norwich, Nottingham, Oxford, Poole, Portsmouth, Reading, Southampton, Torbay, Wolverhampton*):

On Street Parking

- 3.3. Benchmarking identified Plymouths on Street charges to be the same as one and lower than all other Councils, including Devon. The average cost for one hour's parking is £2 per hour, 50p more than Plymouth.

Off Street Parking

- 3.4. Benchmarking was undertaken using the average of the highest and lowest one-hour tariff alongside the average of the highest and lowest all-day charge. Plymouths average one hour charge of £1.15 and average all day charge of £8.50 are some of the lowest of all the Councils, including Devon and Cornwall.

Business Permits

- 3.5. Business permits are challenging to benchmark, as there are significant variations to how other cities approach business support. Variations are around parking restrictions and the functions and services accepted within the context of business parking. Many of the Authorities we approached did offer a form of 'product' supporting care provision, although providing this is several different ways. The common factor was around controls, where any form of support was limited to those directly engaged in the activity of care provision or delivery of services in communities; this is consistent with Plymouth.

Residents Parking

- 3.6. As with business permits, benchmarking identifies that there are significant variations to how Councils approach residential parking, making 'like for like' comparison difficult. There is no 'common' approach to managing residents parking. Councils adopt models that best fit their respective transport strategies. Plymouth applies a fee of £30, irrespective of zone or number of permits. Plymouth has operated this way for the last 15 years, where prices have not been subject to increase, inflationary or otherwise.

Figure 1 - Summary of the fee models applied by Councils benchmarked in managing residents permits:

Model Adopted	Councils Adopting Model	
Fixed Cost per Permit	8	26%
Escalating Charge Model	7	30%
Zonal Model	6	22%
Emissions	2	7%
Emissions and Escalating Model	2	7%
Length of Vehicle	1	4%
Specific Occasions i.e., Sporting Events	1	4%

4. PROPOSALS

- 4.1. The emergence of new systems and technology present an opportunity for the Council to respond to both economic and environmental challenges, recognising the importance of revenue income to support key services and the role of parking in supporting the Councils commitment to be carbon neutral by 2030.
- 4.2. Considering the current situation and opportunities, a review of the service has been undertaken where it is proposed to: -

Modernisation & Investment

- 4.3. Modernise and upgrade all On Street payment systems, increase options to pay to include Apple pay, Android Pay, Google pay, credit card, debit card, mobile app, and phone; removing cash payments to ensure consistency with all Council car parks.
- 4.4. This proposal will enhance customer experience through providing greater choice and ease of use. Customers will not be required to visit payment machines, or to have the right change, making payments easier and ensure consistency in paying to park on street and in car parks. This proposal will also support the Councils commitment to reduce carbon, removing the requirement to collect and bank cash from payment meters around the city.

On Street Parking

- 4.5. Increase the fee for an hour's parking from £1.50 to £2 per hour, revise the daytime tariff to apply from 9am to 9pm (currently 8am to 6pm) and the flat rate evening charge to apply from 9pm to 9am (currently 6pm to 8am) and to introduce a 24-hour tariff at £15. Increasing the hourly rate will bring Plymouths fees more in line with other Councils, supporting the delivery of key services reliant in income from parking. Changing when the daytime and evening tariff applies, alongside introducing a 24-hour tariff, will support our visitor sector in allowing guests more time the next day and the option of purchasing a 24 hour stay, saving £11 on the full rate.
- 4.6. To remove maximum stay restrictions from Armada Way, Basket Ope, Batter Street, Buckwell Street, Catherine Street, Derry's Cross, Gibbon Lane, Gibbon Street, How Street, Lockyer Street (Lower), Looe Street, Notte Street, Palace Street (East), Princess Street, St Andrew's Street, Tavistock Place, The Barbican, The Parade, Whimble Street, Hoe Road, and Madeira Road. This will support visitors in allowing motorist to stay longer, not having to move to another location or cut their visit short. Maximum stays will remain in other streets as these streets support local shops and amenities which thrive on the 'churn' of short stay visitors/shoppers.

Off Street Parking

- 4.7. To simplify the tariff structures of city centre car parks into band A, B and C. Band C being value-based tariffs, band B will represent shoppers 3 hour stay parks supporting city centre shops and band A represents car parks which will allow longer stay. To encourage longer stays by decreasing the 3 hours stay in Band B car parks to 6 hour stays in Band A car parks, with increases to short stays in Band A and B car parks; no changes proposed to Band C (see figure 1.2).
- 4.8. To introduce the ability for any motorists purchasing parking within a band A car park, to use any remaining time in any other Band A, B or C car park. This will support motorists by enabling motorists to move between the city centre and waterfront without further payment i.e. A motorist parking in Theatre Royal to shop, can then use any remaining time in Elphinstone car park, to visit the Waterfront.

Figure 2 – Proposed car park bands and tariffs

Band	Car Parks	Period of Stay	Fee (£)		
			Current	Proposed	Variance
A	Theatre Royal & Regent Street, Elphinstone, Mayflower East, Exchange Street, St Andrews, North Hill, and Guildhall	2 hours	2.60	2.80	+0.20
		3 hours	3.30	3.50	+0.20
		4 hours	4.80	4.80	0
		6 hours	7.20	6.00	-1.20
		24 hours	12.00	12.00	0
B	Mayflower West, Mayflower House, Colin Campbell, Courtney St, Woolworths East & West, Marks & Spencer's Court Yard	1 hour	1.30	1.50	+0.20
		2 hours	2.60	2.70	+0.10
		3 hours (max)	3.90	3.50	-0.40
C	Western Approach	1 hour	1.00	1.00	0
		2 hours	2.00	2.00	0
		3 hours	3.00	3.00	0
		4 hours	4.00	4.00	0
		4 hours	5.00	5.00	0

Residents Parking

- 4.9. It is proposed to move to a model of charging that considers each vehicles impact on our environment; to use this opportunity to support the city's ambitions around climate change. Vehicles are to be split into 5 emission bands, each determined from the CO2 emissions of vehicles. It is proposed to encourage the use of greener vehicles by maintaining the current 14-year unchanged fee for these vehicles, with other fees increasing the more damaging vehicles are to our environment (figure 3)

Figure 3 – Proposed charges and emissions bands for residents parking permits

Emission Band	Pre-2001 Engine Size	Post 2001 Emissions (CO2g/km)	Charge	Examples of Vehicles
1 Electric & Ultra Low	Up to 900	Up to 50	£30	All battery electric vehicles e.g., Nissan Leaf, Tesla models, BMW I models, VW e-Golf, and some hybrids e.g., Passat Hybrid, Mercedes C/E 330e models, Toyota Prius Plug in
2 Low	901 to 1399	50 to 110	£40	Most hybrid models, e.g., Toyota Prius, Yaris & Auris, Range Rover PHEV and most small petrol and diesel vehicles, e.g., Ford Fiesta, Focus (newer models), Vauxhall Corsa, Astra, Kia Ceed, Peugeot 308, Renault Megane, Clio, BMW I series etc.
3 Medium	1400 to 1850	111 to 170	£60	Audi A2,3,4 & 5, BMW 2, 3 4 series (smaller engines), Ford Focus 2.0, Mondeo, Mercedes A, C, E class (newer 180d, 200d and 220d models), VW Golf, Jetta, Hyundai i30, Kona, Seat Leon, Ibiza, Citroen C3, C4, Berlingo, etc
4 High	1851 to 2500	171 to 225	£80	BMW 2,3,4 series, X2, X3, X4, X5, VW Touareg, Tiguan, Audi Q7, Q8, Porsche 911, Cayenne, Land Rover Range Rover & Discovery (sport models), Mercedes E350, GLC
5 Very High	Above 2500	Above 225	£120	Jaguar F-Type V6, Jeep Wrangler 2.8, Mitsubishi Shogun 3.2, Mercedes AMG 63 models, Bentley models, Rolls Royce models, Ferrari models, Maserati models

- 4.10. Department for Transport statistics (May 2022) of vehicles registered in Plymouth indicates that 83% of Plymouth residents are expected to pay £60 or less (£5 @month) and 1.4% of vehicles registered in Plymouth fall into band 5.

- 4.11. Income from residents parking is legislated, where such income is solely to support the cost of operating, managing, and maintaining parking permits schemes. Any additional revenue generated through this proposal will support the costs of maintaining the city's permit zones, including lines, signs, and roads, which is not currently achieved through the current 14-year fee of £30.
- 4.12. To ensure a fair and consistent approach to residents' visitor parking, it is proposed to remove Annual Visitor Permits as used in some areas of Plympton, Plymstock and Crownhill. This will ensure all residents whose visitor's park within resident parking bays use the same Resident Visitor Permits, with the same entitlement and at the same cost.

Business and Health Care Permits

- 4.13. To support businesses who are required to regularly use their vehicles to discharge their business function or service by maintaining the provision of business permits; however, to increase the fee for a short stay business permit from £150 to £200 and from £300 to £400 for a long stay permit.
- 4.14. NHS and health care services meeting defined criteria can use business permits, where a discount is applied, £100 reduced from £150 and £200 reduced from £300. To support the delivery of NHS and health care by creating a dedicated health care permit, independent of the business permits, and to maintain the current discounted rates of £100 short stay and £150 long stay.

District Parking

- 4.15. To support our local districts, it proposed to maintain the support of free parking; however, to amend the amount of free parking at Mutley Plain and implement management controls at other districts, to ensure the free parking is available to support local businesses and services. Reducing the free parking at Mutley Barracks and Napier Street from 3 hours to 2 hours will support local businesses by increasing the ability for local shoppers to park. Currently, some motorists are known to use the 3 hours free parking to visit other locations, such as city centre, university and/or private shopping centres. This does not support local businesses and prevents local shoppers from being able to park; bus operators have also advised this has adversely affected bus patronage.
- 4.16. To support shops and local businesses it is proposed to introduce additional parking controls to ensure motorists do not over staying the allocated free parking periods, making it difficult for other shoppers to park to access local shops and businesses. Motorists would be required to register their free session on a terminal or phone app, as used in several other locations in the city.

Blue Badge Holder Support

- 4.17. To support blue badge holders by expanding the use of the Accessibility Permit to include the city centre district car parks. This will increase accessibility and provide access to new services, such blue badge holder assisted car charging. To increase the fee from £40 to £60 per annum.
- 4.18. To support blue badge holders, it is proposed to maintain the courtesy service of access to disabled driver parking spaces; however, to require successful applicants to meet the cost of £150 to install the disabled bays and therein, whilst they remain eligible for a bay, the cost to remark the bays over time.

Hotelier and Guest House Permits

- 4.19. To maintain the provision of concessionary rate parking for guests of guests houses and hoteliers and support the hospitality sector; however, to reduce the discount by increasing the charge of a permit from £5 to £7. To modernise the hoteliers permit by moving away from paper permits and replace with a virtual permit; permits that hotels and guesthouses can obtain online, via and app or phone call. Permits will be available at any time 24 hours a day, removing the need to book in advance, collect permits from the Council and removes the risk that the guest receives a fine for not displaying their permit.

5. NEXT STEPS

- 5.1. The proposals as set out within this report are subject to statutory consultation. This involves the Council publishing these proposals, via a public notice in the local media and notices displayed within locations with proposed changes, where anyone can submit any representations to the proposals over a 21-day period.
- 5.2. In addition to the above, the Council will write to stakeholders to raise awareness and understanding of the proposals, these will include:
- Plymouth Waterfront Partnership
 - Plymouth City Centre Company
 - Plymouth Hospitality Association
 - Plymouth Area Disability Network
 - Plymouth City Council (*Services which use Permits affected by proposals*)
 - Devon and Cornwall Constabulary
 - Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service
 - Livewell Southwest
 - Plymouth Community Healthcare
 - Plymouth Hospital NHS Trust
 - Harbour Drugs and Alcohol Services
 - Access Plymouth
 - Stroke Association (Plymouth Office)
 - Age UK (Plymouth Office)
 - Parkinson's UK (Plymouth Office)
 - Alzheimer's Society (Plymouth Office)
 - Plymouth Dementia Action Alliance
- 5.3. Following the conclusion of the consultation period, a report submitted to Cabinet setting out the responses received from the consultation.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 5.4. There are costs of £5k associated with advertising and consulting on the proposals within this report. A further Cabinet decision would be required, following conclusion of the consultation, for the Council to decide proposals are to be implemented.
- 5.5. It is not possible to accurately determine the financial implications of the proposals as set out within this report as it is not possible to accurately pre-determine customer behaviour. Modelling based on current trends and data indicates these proposals to realise savings of £413.7k, based on an implementation date of 1st December. The savings are a combination of additional revenue income and savings. This savings are expected to support current in year budget challenges, where the latest budget forecast for Parking (June 22) is a deficit of £405k. Savings are broken down as follows:

Proposal	Projected Benefit (2022/23)
Modernisation and Investment	£21k
On Street Tariffs	£163k
Off Street Tariffs	£52k
Residents Parking Permits	£106k
Business & Health Care Permits	£42k
District Car Parks	£13k
Blue Badge Holder Parking	£10.7k
Hotelier and Guest House Permits	£6k
Total	£413.7k

- 5.6. There are costs associated with implementing these proposals. There is an existing capital allocation to fund the modernisation of payment systems; however, there are revenue costs of £30k associated with advertising, lines, signs, and reconfiguration of systems.

6. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 6.1. The proposals within this report seek to provide a balanced response to both economic and environmental changes. The proposals set out how parking can play a role in supporting the Councils commitment to be carbon neutral by 2030, recognise and respond to financial challenges and the important of parking revenue is sustaining support to key services and in how we can improve and modernise our services to customers. It is therefore the recommendation of this report to undertake consultation on the proposals as set out within this report, and to provide a report to Cabinet on conclusion of the consultation.

APPENDIX A – BENCHMARKING

On Street Parking

Council	1 hour (Average)	% Variance
Blackpool	£1.50	0.00%
Plymouth	£1.50	-
Torbay	£1.60	6.67%
Nottingham	£1.80	20.00%
Portsmouth	£1.80	20.00%
Wolverhampton	£1.80	20.00%
Poole	£1.95	30.00%
Southampton	£2.00	33.33%
Coventry	£2.00	33.33%
Doncaster	£2.00	33.33%
Devon (Exeter)	£2.00	33.33%
Newcastle	£2.00	33.33%
Bournemouth	£2.05	36.67%
Cardiff	£2.10	40.00%
Norwich	£2.10	40.00%
Reading	£2.15	43.33%
Derby	£2.30	53.33%
Newham	£2.30	53.33%
Liverpool	£2.40	60.00%
Manchester	£2.40	60.00%
Canterbury	£2.40	50.00%
Birmingham	£2.85	78.13%
Cambridge	£3.50	94.44%
Bristol	£3.75	108.33%
Brighton	£4.00	122.22%
Oxford	£6.00	233.33%
Cornwall	No On Street pay and display	

Off Street Parking

Average of Highest and Lowest Tariff	1 Hour	Average of Highest and Lowest Tariff	All day
Doncaster	£1.00	Doncaster	£6.00
Southampton	£1.00	Southampton	£6.00
Wolverhampton	£1.10	Plymouth	£8.50
Plymouth	£1.15	Cornwall (Truro)	£8.70
Poole	£1.30	Derby	£8.70
Blackpool	£1.50	Torbay	£9.00
Portsmouth	£1.50	Reading	£10.10
Liverpool	£1.60	Norwich	£10.20
Torbay	£1.60	Wolverhampton	£10.25
Newcastle	£1.65	Portsmouth	£11.35
Reading	£1.65	Blackpool	£11.50
Cornwall (Truro)	£1.70	Birmingham	£11.60
Derby	£1.80	Nottingham	£12.25
Canterbury	£1.85	Bournemouth	£12.50
Norwich	£1.90	Liverpool	£13.00
Bristol	£2.00	Cardiff	£13.20
Cardiff	£2.10	Bristol	£13.50
Bournemouth	£2.15	Canterbury	£15.00
Newham	£2.30	Exeter/Devon County	£15.50
Cambridge	£2.45	Manchester	£18.15
Coventry	£2.65	Newcastle	£18.90
Brighton	£3.75	Cambridge	£22.20
Manchester	£4.45	Newham	£25.90
Oxford	£5.50	Brighton	£26.75
Birmingham	N/A	Coventry	£26.80
Exeter (Devon County)	N/A	Oxford	£30.50
Nottingham	N/A	Poole	N/A

City	Approach	Fees and Charges
Birmingham	Zonal	£19 to £263
Blackpool	Fixed	£15 (Max of one resident's permit)
Bournemouth	Zonal	£50, £100 or £200
Brighton	Emissions	£60 to £385
Bristol	Emissions & Escalating	£0 (up to 100g/km) to £224
Cambridge	Zonal	£54 to £102
Canterbury	Zonal	£60, £65, £88, £150
Cardiff	Escalating	1st £7.50 and 2nd £30
Cornwall	Escalating	1st £50 and 2nd £75
Coventry	Fixed	£20.00
Derby	Escalating	1st £25 and 2nd £50
Doncaster	Fixed	£26
Exeter	Fixed	£30
Liverpool	Escalating	1st £0, 2nd £40, 3rd £60 and 4th onwards £100
Manchester	Zonal	£200 to £750
Newcastle	Emissions & Escalating	1st £25 & 2nd £75. £12.50 discount for electric vehicle (not hybrids)
Newham	Emissions	£0 (0-50 g/km) £60 (51-110 g/km) £100 (111-170 g/km) £150 (171-225 g/km) & £200 (226+ g/km)
Norwich	Length	Vehicle length - £24.60 (short), £37.20 (medium) & £52.80 (long)
Oxford	Escalating	1st £65, 2nd £65, 3rd £130 and over 3 £200
Plymouth	Fixed	£30
Poole	Fixed	£55
Portsmouth	Escalating	1st £30, 2nd £120 and 3rd £300
Reading	Escalating	1st £44, 2nd £165 and 3rd £331
Southampton	Zonal	£0 to £100
Torbay	Fixed	£30 (Max of two)
Wolverhampton	Only Match Days	Only on match days
Worcester	Escalating	1st £30, 2nd £40 and 3rd £60

