

# COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS AND PROPORTIONALITY MAY 2023



## I. LEGISLATIVE REQUIREMENTS OF PROPORTIONALITY

- I.1. Section 15 (5) of the Local Government and Housing Act 1989 imposes a duty on Councils to review the representation of different political groups on bodies to which the Council makes appointments. The Act requires that the review should be held at the Annual General Meeting or as soon as practicable after that meeting or when the membership of the Council changes.
- I.2. The Act provides four principles concerning political representation that must be observed when conducting a review. These are:
- a) that not all the seats on committees are allocated to the same political group;
  - b) that the majority of the seats on each committee are allocated to a particular political group if the number of persons belonging to that group are a majority of the authority's membership;
  - c) subject to (a) and (b), that the number of seats on committees which are allocated to each group bears the same proportion to the total of all the seats on committees of the council as is borne by the number of members of that group to the membership of the authority, and
  - d) Subject to (a) to (c) above, that the number of seats on each committee which are allocated to each political group bears the same proportion to the number of all the seats on that committee as is borne by the number of members of that group to the membership of the authority.
- I.3. The legislation provides that the Council may make alternative arrangements to the 'proportionality' principles only by a unanimous vote, with no member voting against.
- I.4. The Committees and Panels to which the provisions of Section 15 of the Act apply, and the recommended allocation of seats on each, applying the principles of the Act as closely as is reasonably practicable, are shown in Section 2 below. The recommended allocation of seats reflects the four proportionality principles so far as reasonably practicable.

## 2. OVERALL PROPORTIONALITY 2023/2024 - NUMBER OF SEATS ON COUNCIL

| Group               | May 2023    |
|---------------------|-------------|
| Labour              | 31 (56.14%) |
| Conservative        | 18 (31.58%) |
| Green               | 2 (3.51%)   |
| Independent Group   | 2 (3.51%)   |
| Independent Members | 1 (1.75%)   |
| Vacancies           | 1 (1.75%)   |

\* There are 57 members on Plymouth City Council. The Local Government and Housing Act 1989, which sets out how seats should be allocated to members on a Council, describes the distribution of seats between the political Groups into which the Council has

divided itself. There is no seat entitlement to members who are not in a Group. The definition of what constitutes a group on a Council is covered in The Local Government (Committees and Political Groups) Regulations 1990 and can be found in the following link <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/uk/si/1990/1553/part/III/made>

A single representative does not constitute a Group which is defined as a number of persons bound together by common interests. As such, a single Member is not entitled to any Committee seats. This is consistent with practice previously employed by the Council in similar circumstances.

## 2.1. The application of the legislative principles is set out below:

| Local Government Act 1989 – Principles   | Is this principle met?                                |
|--|---|
| a. that not all the seats on committees are allocated to the same political group  | <b>Principle Met</b>                                  |
| b. that the majority of the seats on each committee are allocated to a particular political group if the number of persons belonging to that group are a majority of the authority's membership;   | <b>Principle Met</b>                                  |
| c. subject to (a) and (b), that the number of seats on committees which are allocated to each group bears the same proportion to the total of all the seats on committees of the council as is borne by the number of members of that group to the membership of the authority;          | <b>Principle met</b> as far as reasonably practicable |
| d. Subject to (a) to (c) above, that the number of seats on each committee which are allocated to each political group bears the same proportion to the number of all the seats on that committee as is borne by the number of members of that group to the membership of the authority. | <b>Principle met</b> as far as reasonably practicable |

| Labour 31 / Conservative 18 / Green 2 / Independent Group 2<br>Three unaligned Independents / One Vacancy - Excluded from Proportionality Calculations |           |               |           |               |          |       |          |       | <b>Total Seats</b> |
|--|-----------|---------------|-----------|---------------|----------|-------|----------|-------|--------------------|
| <b>Councillors</b>   | <b>18</b> | <b>31.58%</b> | <b>31</b> | <b>56.14%</b> | <b>2</b> | 3.51% | <b>2</b> | 3.51% | <b>53 (92.98%)</b> |
| <b>Total Seat Allocation as % membership</b>   | <b>42</b> | 42.00         | <b>75</b> | 74.67         | <b>5</b> | 4.67  | <b>5</b> | 4.67  |                    |
|  |           |               |           |               |          |       |          |       | <b>Total Seats</b> |
| <b>Planning Committee</b>  | <b>4</b>  | 4.11          | <b>7</b>  | 7.30          | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | 13                 |
| <b>Taxi Licensing Committee</b>  | <b>2</b>  | 2.21          | <b>5</b>  | 3.93          | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | 7                  |
| <b>Licensing Committee</b>   | <b>4</b>  | 4.11          | <b>7</b>  | 7.30          | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | 13                 |
| <b>Chief Officer Appointments Panel</b>  | <b>3</b>  | 2.21          | <b>4</b>  | 3.93          | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | 7                  |
| <b>Chief Officer Disciplinary Panel</b>  | <b>3</b>  | 2.21          | <b>4</b>  | 3.93          | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | 7                  |
| <b>Chief Officer Appeals Panel</b>   | <b>3</b>  | 2.21          | <b>4</b>  | 3.93          | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | 7                  |
| <b>Audit and Governance Committee</b>  | <b>2</b>  | 1.58          | <b>3</b>  | 2.81          | <b>0</b> | 0.18  | <b>0</b> | 0.18  | 5                  |
| <b>Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry JC</b>  | <b>2</b>  | 1.58          | <b>3</b>  | 2.81          | <b>0</b> | 0.18  | <b>0</b> | 0.18  | 5                  |
| <b>Devon and Somerset Fire Authority</b>   | <b>1</b>  | 1.26          | <b>3</b>  | 2.25          | <b>0</b> | 0.14  | <b>0</b> | 0.14  | 4                  |
| <b>Growth and Infrastructure Scrutiny</b>  | <b>4</b>  | 4.11          | <b>7</b>  | 7.30          | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | 13                 |
| <b>Performance Scrutiny</b>  | <b>4</b>  | 4.11          | <b>7</b>  | 7.30          | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | 13                 |
| <b>Children's Scrutiny</b>   | <b>4</b>  | 4.11          | <b>7</b>  | 7.30          | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | 13                 |
| <b>Health &amp; Adult Care Scrutiny</b>  | <b>4</b>  | 4.11          | <b>7</b>  | 7.30          | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | <b>1</b> | 0.46  | 13                 |
| <b>Standards Advisory Board</b>  | <b>2</b>  | 1.89          | <b>4</b>  | 3.37          | <b>0</b> | 0.21  | <b>0</b> | 0.21  | 6                  |
| <b>Lord Mayors Selection Committee</b>   | <b>2</b>  | 2.21          | <b>5</b>  | 3.93          | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | <b>0</b> | 0.25  | 7                  |
| <b>Seats allocated</b>   | <b>44</b> | +2            | <b>77</b> | +2            | <b>6</b> | +1    | <b>6</b> | +1    | 133                |

## Regulatory Committees

|  |
|--|
| <b>Planning Committee</b>  |
| <b>13 councillors (proportional)</b>   |
| <b>Seven Labour Councillors, Four Conservative Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Group Councillor.</b>    |
| Councillor <b>Bill Stevens (Chair)</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Tina Tuohy (Vice Chair)</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Jeremy Goslin</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Angela Penrose</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Zoe Reilly</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Ian Tuffin</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Sarah Allen</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Rebecca Smith</b>  |
| Councillor <b>James Stoneman</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Kathy Watkin</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Ian Darcy</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Ian Poyser</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Patrick Nicholson</b>  |
|  |
| <b>Substitutes</b>   |
| Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed planning training |

|   |
|---|
| <b>Taxi Licensing Committee</b>   |
| <b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>   |
| <b>Five Labour Councillor, Two Conservative Councillors</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Dylan Tippetts (Chair)</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Ian Tuffin (Vice Chair)</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Eddie Rennie</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Keith Moore</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Sally Haydon</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Chip Tofan</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Lee Finn</b>  |
|   |
| Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed training |

|  |
|--|
| <b>Licensing Committee</b>   |
| <b>Thirteen councillors (proportional)</b>   |
| <b>Seven Labour Councillors, Four Conservative Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Group Councillor.</b>    |
| Councillor <b>Eddie Rennie (Chair)</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Sarah Allen (Vice Chair)</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Dr Charlotte Cree</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Neil Hendy</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Keith Moore</b>  |
| Councillor <b>John Stephens</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Dylan Tippetts</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Pat Patel</b>  |
| Councillor <b>John Mahony</b>  |
| Councillor <b>David Salmon</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Phil Partridge</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Ian Poyser</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Patrick Nicholson</b>  |
| Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed planning training |

|  |
|--|
| <b>Audit and Governance Committee</b>  |
| <b>Five councillors (proportional)</b>   |
| <b>Three Labour Councillors, Two Conservative Councillors</b>  |
|  |
| Councillor <b>Sarah Allen (Chair)</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Mark Lowry</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Bill Stevens</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Lee Finn (Vice Chair)</b>  |
| Councillor <b>John Mahony</b>  |
|  |
|  |
| Any councillor may act as a substitute member if they have undergone the Council's prescribed training |

## Scrutiny Committees

|   |
|---|
| <b>Performance, Finance and Customer Focus Overview and Scrutiny Committee</b>  |
| <b>Thirteen councillors (proportional)</b>  |
| <b>Seven Labour Councillors, Four Conservative Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Group Councillor.</b> |
| Councillor Sarah Allen  |
| Councillor Tess Blight  |
| Councillor Jeremy Goslin (Vice Chair)   |
| Councillor Neil Hendy   |
| Councillor Keith Moore  |
| Councillor Bill Stevens   |
| Councillor Tina Tuohy   |
| Councillor Ian Darcy (Chair)  |
| Councillor Chip Tofan   |
| Councillor Richard Bingley  |
| Councillor James Stoneman   |
| Councillor Ian Poyser   |
| Councillor Terri Beer   |
| With the exception of Cabinet Members, any councillor may act as a substitute member                                    |



## Health and Adult Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee

Thirteen councillors (proportional)

Seven Labour Councillors, Four Conservative Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Group Councillor.

Councillor **Pauline Murphy (Chair)**

Councillor **Will Noble**

Councillor **Angela Penrose**

Councillor **Zoe Reilly**

Councillor **John Stephens**

Councillor **Ian Tuffin**

Councillor **Tina Tuohy**

Councillor **Natalie Harrison (Vice Chair)**

Councillor **John Mahony**

Councillor **Kathy Watkin**

Councillor **Lee Finn**

Councillor **Lauren McLay**

Councillor **Patrick Nicholson**

With the exception of Cabinet Members, any councillor may act as a substitute member

## Education and Children's Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee

Thirteen councillors (proportional)

Seven Labour Councillors, Four Conservative Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Group Councillor.

Councillor [Zoe Reilly \(Chair\)](#)

Councillor [Charlotte Cree](#)

Councillor [Jon Dingle](#)

Councillor [Charlotte Holloway](#)

Councillor [Angela Penrose](#)

Councillor [John Stephens](#)

Councillor [Dylan Tippetts](#)

Councillor [Charlotte Carlyle \(Vice Chair\)](#)

Councillor [Andrea Loveridge](#)

Councillor [Natalie Harrison](#)

Councillor [Phil Partridge](#)

Councillor [Lauren McLay](#)

Councillor [Terri Beer](#)

With the exception of Cabinet Members, any councillor may act as a substitute member

| <b>Growth and Infrastructure Overview and Scrutiny Committee</b>  |
|---|
| <b>Thirteen councillors (proportional)</b>  |
| <b>Seven Labour Councillors, Four Conservative Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Group Councillor.</b> |
|   |
| Councillor <b>Ian Tuffin (Vice Chair)</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Lyndsay Gilmour</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Jeremy Goslin</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Will Noble</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Kevin Sproston</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Bill Stephens</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Dylan Tippetts</b>  |
| Councillor <b>David Salmon</b>  |
| Councillor <b>James Stoneman</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Richard Bingley (Chair)</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Charlotte Carlyle</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Ian Poyser</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Patrick Nicholson</b>   |
|   |
| With the exception of Cabinet Members, any councillor may act as a substitute member                                    |

## Chief Officer Panels

|   |
|---|
| <b>Chief Officer Appointments Panel</b>   |
| <b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>   |
| <b>Four Labour Councillors, Three Conservative Councillors</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Tudor Evans OBE (Chair)</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Mary Aspinall</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Jemima Laing</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Eddie Rennie</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Ian Darcy</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Kathy Watkin</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Andy Lugger</b>   |
|   |
| Cabinet Members must not be in the majority on the panel  |
| Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed personnel training |
| <b>Chief Officer Disciplinary Panel</b>   |
| <b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>   |
| <b>Four Labour Councillors, Three Conservative Councillors</b>  |
|   |
| Councillor <b>Tess Blight</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Sally Haydon</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Mark Lowry</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Eddie Rennie</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Andy Lugger</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Bill Wakeham</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Pat Patel</b>   |
|   |
| Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed personnel training |
| <b>Chief Officer Appeals Panel</b>  |
| <b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>   |
| <b>Four Labour Councillors, Three Conservative Councillors</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Sarah Allen</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Neil Hendy</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Pauline Murphy</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Chris Penberthy</b>   |
| Councillor <b>Kathy Watkin</b>  |
| Councillor <b>Charlotte Carlyle</b>   |

Councillor [David Salmon](#)

Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed personnel training.

## Joint Committees / Authorities

|  |
|--|
| <b>Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee</b>         |
|  |
| <b>Five councillors (proportional)</b>                         |
| <b>Three Labour Councillors, Two Conservative Councillors.</b> |
| Councillor <b>Neil Hendy (Co-Vice Chair)</b>                   |
| Councillor <b>Mark Coker</b>                                   |
| Councillor <b>Jon Dingle</b>                                   |
| Councillor <b>James Stoneman</b>                               |
| Councillor <b>Bill Wakeham</b>                                 |

|  |
|--|
| <b>Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Authority</b>            |
|  |
| <b>Four councillors (proportional)</b>                         |
| <b>Three Labour Councillors, One Conservative Councillors.</b> |
| Councillor <b>Lyndsay Gilmour</b>                              |
| Councillor <b>Neil Hendy</b>                                   |
| Councillor <b>Kevin Sproston</b>                               |
| Councillor <b>Pat Patel</b>                                    |

## Other Committees

|  |
|--|
| <b>Lord Mayor Selection Committee</b>                        |
| <b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>                      |
| <b>Two Conservative Councillors, Five Labour Councillors</b> |
|  |
| Councillor <a href="#">Mary Aspinall</a>                     |
| Councillor <a href="#">Sue Dann</a>                          |
| Councillor <a href="#">Tudor Evans</a>                       |
| Councillor <a href="#">Pauline Murphy</a>                    |
| Councillor <a href="#">Chris Penberthy</a>                   |
| Councillor <a href="#">Andy Luggier</a>                      |
| Councillor <a href="#">Pat Patel</a>                         |

|   |
|---|
| <b>Standards Advisory Group</b>                               |
| <b>Six councillors (proportional)</b>                         |
| <b>Four Labour Councillors, Two Conservative Councillors,</b> |
|   |
| Councillor <a href="#">Eddie Rennie (Chair)</a>               |
| Councillor <a href="#">Mary Aspinall</a>                      |
| Councillor <a href="#">Sarah Allen</a>                        |
| Councillor <a href="#">Neil Hendy</a>                         |
| Councillor <a href="#">Rebecca Smith</a>                      |
| Councillor <a href="#">John Mahony</a>                        |

## Non-Proportional Committees of Council Joint Committees / Authorities

|   |
|---|
| <b>Joint Health Scrutiny</b>                |
| <b>Three councillors (not proportional)</b> |
| Councillor <a href="#">Zoe Reilly</a>       |
| Councillor <a href="#">Pauline Murphy</a>   |
| Councillor <a href="#">John Mahony</a>      |

**Devon and Cornwall Police and Crime Panel****Two councillors (not proportional)**Councillor [Sally Haydon](#)Councillor [Chris Penberthy](#)**Heart of the South West Local Enterprise Partnership Joint Scrutiny Committee****Two councillors (not proportional)**Councillor [Ian Tuffin](#)Councillor [Charlotte Cree](#)**Other Committees****Devon Audit Partnership****Two councillors (not proportional)**Councillor [Jeremy Goslin](#)Councillor [Andy Luggier](#)**Health and Wellbeing Board****Four councillors (not proportional)**Councillor [Mary Aspinall \(Chair\)](#)Councillor [Jemima Laing](#)Councillor [John Mahony](#)Councillor [Charlotte Carlyle](#)**Cabinet Committees / Advisory Groups****Corporate Parenting Group****Eight councillors (political equality by convention)**Councillor [Jemima Laing](#)Councillor [Sally Cresswell](#)Councillor [Zoe Riley](#)Councillor [Dylan Tippetts](#)Councillor [Charlotte Carlyle](#)Councillor [Andrea Loveridge](#)



|                                      |
|--------------------------------------|
| Councillor <a href="#">Lee Finn</a>  |
| Councillor <a href="#">Pat Patel</a> |

|  |                 |
|--|-----------------|
| <b>South West Devon Joint Waste Partnership (One meeting per year)</b> |                 |
| <b>Two councillors (Cabinet Members) One observer</b>                  |                 |
| Councillor <a href="#">Tom Briars-Delve</a>                            |                 |
| Councillor <a href="#">Mark Coker</a>                                  |                 |
| Councillor <a href="#">Bill Wakeham</a>                                | <b>Observer</b> |

|  |                    |
|--|--------------------|
| <b>Mount Edgcumbe Joint Committee</b>        |                    |
| <b>Seven councillors</b>                     |                    |
| Councillor <a href="#">Tom Briars-Delve</a>  | <b>Joint Chair</b> |
| Councillor <a href="#">Tess Blight</a>       |                    |
| Councillor <a href="#">Lyndsay Gilmour</a>   |                    |
| Councillor <a href="#">Angela Penrose</a>    |                    |
| Councillor <a href="#">David Salmon</a>      |                    |
| Councillor <a href="#">Charlotte Carlyle</a> |                    |
| Councillor <a href="#">James Stoneman</a>    |                    |

|   |              |
|---|--------------|
| <b>Child Poverty Working Group</b>                        |              |
| <b>Six councillors (political equality by convention)</b> |              |
| <b>Chair to be relevant Cabinet member</b>                |              |
| Councillor <a href="#">Chris Penberthy</a>                | <b>Chair</b> |
| Councillor <a href="#">Sue Dann</a>                       |              |
| Councillor <a href="#">Jemima Laing</a>                   |              |
| Councillor <a href="#">Natalie Harrison</a>               |              |
| Councillor <a href="#">Rebecca Smith</a>                  |              |
| Councillor <a href="#">Andrea Loveridge</a>               |              |